

HOUSING SUMMIT FOLLOW-UP

With John Ryan

VETERAN'S MEMORIAL COMMUNITY CENTER

February 28, 2014 9:00 am

Community Housing Council: Ann Maguire, Susan Cook and Donna Szeker.

Excused: Kristin Hatch [work]

Board of Selectmen: Elaine Anderson, Tom Donegan and David McChesney.

John Ryan gave some opening remarks. A Draft Action Plan was distributed to all attendees for review, discussion, and editing line by line. Opportunity for attendees to be clear and make changes section by section as if written in pencil. Hopefully there will be consensus at the end. If those present approve the amended form, it will be presented to the Community Housing Council; if they accept it will be presented to the Board of Selectmen.

See attached revised draft Action Plan for specific changes.

Tom Donegan: are the target numbers in the plan aspirational or something to be held accountable to? Numbers seem high; prefer accountable goal. John Ryan: can consider all units – those deed restricted as well as those under tax incentive program -- as part of it. Ted Malone noted that some overlap; some deed restricted units receive the tax exemption but not all.

Discussion of definition of “community housing” and “affordable housing;” the Zoning by-laws include definitions.

About 200 deed restricted units now – 10 years from now what should the goal be? Limited resources – what is a pipe dream? Mary-Jo Avellar – need more. Daily people need housing. It is going to be a ghost town. It is a desperate situation.

John Ryan: it is about creating new opportunities; not just building new units.

Cheryl Andrews: maybe add short-term language with attainable target over 3 to 4 years.

John Ryan: The overall goal is to add more units that those lost to condo conversion. Goal of 10%; could achieve 10% by 2017. This is minimum goal; should have greater than that.

What about discrimination? Can add another section to address that.

Tom Donegan note that Board of Selectmen is not in session so any comments are as individuals.

Ted Malone: should have a separate target goal for seasonal needs.

Ted Malone: perhaps should have a sliding scale for different income levels; between 60% and 80% AMI have reduced tax exemption.

Consensus to accept the amended plan. The Appendix will include a list of people who attended the Summit and this day's session and will indicate those who vote to accept the plan. Can ask those who left early if they want their name included as voting.

Char Priolo MOVE to accept the Action Plan as amended and to present it to the Community Housing Council for approval; Stephen Milkewicz second; approved 23-0.

Donna Szeker MOVE that the Community Housing Council accept the Housing Action Plan; Susan Cook second; approved 3-0.

Meeting adjourned at 12:41 pm

Submitted by: Michelle Jarusiewicz, Community Housing Specialist

PROVINCETOWN HOUSING ACTION PLAN

March 2014

A group of Provincetown officials, citizens and stakeholders came together on December 9, 2013, January 10, 2014 and again on February 28, 2014 to prepare a plan of actions that address Provincetown's housing needs. The individuals listed in Appendix A presented the following list of recommended actions to the Provincetown Community Housing Council (CHC). The CHC in turn voted on to accept these recommendations; to present the Housing Action Plan to the Provincetown Board of Selectmen; and to ask the Board of Selectmen to endorse the actions herein and provide ongoing support to see these actions implemented.

PURPOSE

The motivation to undertake the following Housing Actions comes out of a deep-felt desire to sustain Provincetown as a thriving year-round community that provides safe, secure and affordable housing for year-round and seasonal residents who work in town, for businesses looking for the stable population and housing base needed to expand the community's year round economy, for families hoping to raise their children here, and for seniors hoping to stay in the community as they age.

PROBLEM STATEMENT

The unique characteristics of Provincetown's restricted land base, its low-wage seasonal economy, and the attractiveness of its housing for seasonal use, are steadily eroding the town's capacity to sustain itself on a year-round basis. The community-housing problem is long-standing and is inherent in these conditions. There are no easy solutions. What is needed, and what those assembled to create this plan bring, is a sense of urgency; a common commitment to do whatever is needed to sustain a viable, diverse year-round community; and the steady commitment to increasing the stock of housing that serves the needs of the community. See Appendix B for the 2013 Provincetown's Housing Needs Assessment.

APPROACH

There is no one entity in Town that can ensure that these actions happen any more than there is any one entity that can ensure that Provincetown remains a viable year-round community. Ultimately everyone's help is needed: renters and homeowners, young and old, individuals and families, government officials, seasonal residents, realtors, housing developers, and local employers. Everyone is a stakeholder in this endeavor. The actions listed in this document have identified a number of existing entities that can carry forward the actions recommended. In other cases, new entities will need to form to do the work needed. This plan envisions a network of diverse

groups working in concert to accomplish these individual actions and others that will follow. The Provincetown Community Housing Council (CHC) offers to serve as the hub for that network: facilitating communications between the network partners; engaging ever-broader participation; and monitoring, evaluating and communicating progress on multiple fronts.

KEY LEVERAGE AREAS

Seven leverage areas focus and organize these proposed actions. These are the key places where community efforts can leverage large changes in the town's capacity to meet its Affordable and Community Housing goals. The seven areas include:

1. Education
2. Affordable and Community Housing Development and Redevelopment
3. Getting the Incentives Right
4. Slowing the Loss of Year-Round Rental Stock
5. Engaging the Second Home Community
6. Connecting Owners and Renters
7. Funding the Effort

TARGETS

When faced with a large and difficult challenge like this, it is important to aim for real and positive change that can be measured year-to-year. With that in mind, the proposed actions are intended to help meet two numeric targets:

- **We set a target of doubling the number of Affordable and Community Housing units from 200 to 400 by 2025 (see Appendix B);**
- **Each year from 2014 to 2025, our target is to add more units of Affordable and Community Housing than the number of housing units lost to condominium conversion**
- **We set a short-term target of achieving a 10 -percent level of SHI by 2017.**

This will require a broad array of micro- and larger scale, as well as both short-term and permanent additions to the town's Affordable and Community Housing stock. The nature and severity of the Affordable and Community Housing need demands flexibility of approach to meet the scale of these targets.

ACTIONS

The following identify specific actions within each leverage area aimed to achieve the targets of this 2014 Affordable and Community Housing Action Plan.

1. EDUCATION

This leverage point is critical to the success of all the others. Education covers a range of ongoing actions needed to communicate the nature of the housing situation in Provincetown and its impact on the sustainability of the year-round community. Education includes the sharing of accurate information about the progress of efforts to address the problem. This leverage point includes engaging parts of the community (such as the young, families, renters, employers and the like) who are the “real faces” of this problem and whose involvement will promote positive change, as well as communicating with other sectors of the community whose concerns may be impeding progress.

Action 1.1. Task the Provincetown Community Housing Council (CHC) to develop a broad housing education plan to identify key audiences, including second-homeowners, engage key opinion leaders, develop the networks to communicate information, craft effective messages to communicate the importance of this issue, and develop methods for providing information to key audiences on the regular and as needed basis.

Action 1.2. Task the CHC with educating the community by indentifying and publicizing a resource/point of contact for anyone experiencing discrimination based on race, sex, religion, disability or family makeup, or those who are protected by the Fair Housing Law.

The CHC may serve at first only to convene this effort and ensure that a plan develops in a timely fashion. The CHC will serve as the hub in implementing this plan through many other organizations.

2. AFFORDABLE AND COMMUNITY HOUSING DEVELOPMENT

In order to address the scale of the community-housing need, Provincetown will need to support new project-scale developments, as well as reuse of existing structures, and micro-developments aimed at creating as little as one unit at a time. Given the limited opportunities to develop land or existing structures, the focus should be on dedicating as much of these limited resources to Affordable and Community Housing purposes. Key actions include:

Action 2.1. Task the Provincetown Housing Authority (PHA) with accelerating its efforts to expand Maushope Senior Housing.

The PHA has been working on the development of an additional 16-19 units of senior housing to the existing Maushope project. The need for additional

acquisition and state financing represent key hurdles to making this happen. Highlight this action is a way of providing support and encouragement for the PHA to accelerate to make this happen. The CHC invites the PHA to use the Council as a resource to address their development challenges.

[Note: A Massachusetts Community Development Block Grant was submitted for \$800,000 on 2/14/14 for a sewer connection and for planning funds to allow for expansion. Awards may be announced in June 2014.]

Action 2.2. Task the Provincetown Board of Selectmen (BOS) and the town's state legislative delegation to support Community Housing Resource's effort to accelerate the development of Stable Path, a 23-unit rental project proposed off Race Point Road.

Stable Path is a proposed 23-unit rental development located off Race Point Road. The developer Community Housing Resource, Inc. (CHR) secured \$540,000 in Community Preservation Act (CPA) funding in 2009. The Community Housing Council also approved an additional \$175,000 in Provincetown Affordable Housing Trust Funds on 7/18/13. The project remains in the funding pipeline with the MA Department of Housing & Community Development (DHCD). The Board of Selectmen approved a strong letter of support on 2/24/14. CPA funds committed by the CPC and Town Meeting are a critical piece of the funding and must remain committed. There is the need for the BOS and the state legislative delegation to continue support for and lobby to accelerate the funding to develop this project.

Action 2.3. Task the CHC with inviting the Cape Cod chapter of Habitat for Humanity to partner with them to identify and create new housing opportunities using Habitat for Humanity in Provincetown.

Habitat for Humanity is active in Truro and several other Cape communities. In addition to offering a well-proven model for creating small-scale additions to Affordable and Community Housing, Habitat for Humanity is often a highly effective generator of community participation and engagement in the challenges of affordable housing generally.

Action 2.4. Task the Board of Selectmen with requesting from the Town's Housing Specialist an updated assessment of the development potential of existing town-owned land and buildings for creation of Affordable and Community Housing.

This assessment should consider the potential for a land swap involving the school departments land at Motta Field as well as the ability of the Town to

apply for CDBG funds for infrastructure improvements to support development of town owned parcels for Affordable and Community Housing purposes.

Action 2.5. Task the CHC with inviting local employers, town officials, and developers to discuss the potential development of a seasonal employee dormitory that could include utilization of the Grace Gouveia building (if available) or Old Community Center among its options.

[NOTE: Proposals have been received by the Town and are under review that may meet this action step.]

ACTION 2.6. TASK THE CHC TO INVITE THE PROVINCETOWN CHAMBER OF COMMERCE, THE PROVINCETOWN BUSINESS GUILD, THE PROVINCETOWN VISITORS' SERVICE BOARD AND THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY TO DISCUSS MEANINGFUL ASSESSMENT OF THE NEED FOR SEASONAL HOUSING.

3. GETTING THE INCENTIVES RIGHT

Provincetown has tried a number of incentives to promote using existing structures as Affordable and Community Housing additions, but to date the utilization of these incentives remains low. Participants at the housing summit recognized that when created the goal of these incentives was to create long-term affordability covenants in exchange for the tax or use relief offered. Given the under-utilization of these incentives and the critical need for even short- and medium-term increases in affordable rental stock, the length and character of the restrictions need to better match the willingness of residents to utilize them. As part of an overall plan to reduce owners' reluctance to renting to seasonal and year-round residents, the next set of actions ask the Planning Board to adjust the incentives to promote greater utilization.

Action 3.1. Task the Provincetown Planning Board with amending appropriate articles of the Zoning By-law that affect the permitting of accessory units by changing the 20-year deed restriction to a shorter-term contract with the Town. Accessory units are allowed under zoning by-law section 4800. As part of this action, task the Provincetown Community Preservation Committee (CPC) with proposing the use of CPA funds to contract for outreach and administration of units in program.

Action 3.2. Task the Board of Selectmen to adopt a policy authorizing eligibility under the current Property Tax Exemption program [Chapter 408 of the Acts of 2002] to allow for eligibility up to 80% AMI [Area Median Income] in a manner that reflects the need across the range of eligible incomes. This increase from the current 60% AMI will allow for greater incentives to allow for greater participation.

Action 3.3. Task the Planning Board with reviewing the existing special permits, sub-division approvals, and zoning by-laws for language that

prevents or discourages the use of any residential property for year-round rental and provide a plan of action to remove those discouragements.

Certain special permits and sub-division approvals may contain language that prohibits rentals. An effort to identify those restrictions and where possible eliminate or work around them would remove both a real and perceived hindrance to making more year-round rentals available.

Action 3.4. Task the Planning Board with examining ways to allow accessory dwelling to be separate from OR attached to a main building, if such dwellings are used expressly for year-round Affordable and Community Housing.

Action 3.5. Task the Town Planner to identify the mechanism that would allow for forgiveness of sewer betterment and other permitting fees when “Affordable and Community Housing” units are created.

Action 3.6. Task the CHC and CPC with working together to create a mechanism to subsidize the cost of rehabilitation done for the purpose of using existing structures to increase Affordable and Community Housing options.

Action 3.7 Task the BOS with updating the Local Comprehensive Plan (LCP).

4. SLOWING THE LOSS OF YEAR-ROUND RENTAL STOCK

While the Town of Provincetown has been sincerely committed to filling the bucket of Affordable and Community Housing options, the steady conversion of multi-family residences to seasonal condominiums represents a hole in that bucket. Though the creators of this plan understand that this is a politically charged and legally sensitive issue, to do nothing to stem the loss of these units seems untenable. The following actions seek to explore what can be done within the framework of state law to stem the loss of multi-family units in this way; and also to explore whether there may be some way for the process of condo-conversion to be diverted to serve Affordable and Community Housing needs more effectively.

Action 4.1. Task the BOS with authorizing legal counsel to prepare a report on legal avenues to reducing the conversion of residential properties to condominiums except where those conversions add to the stock of year-round, affordable Affordable and Community Housing.

Action 4.2. Based on the report from Town Counsel (Action 4.1), task the Planning Board with amending the applicable provisions of the zoning bylaw relating to condominium conversions to reduce the rate of conversion of residential properties to condominiums except where those conversions add to the stock of year-round, Affordable and Community Housing.

Action 4.3 Task the Planning Board and Zoning Board of Appeals to give priority in decisions for year round affordable and community housing units when determining community benefit in the granting of Special Permits and Site Plan Approvals.

It will be important for the BOS, in its appointing authority, to ensure promotion of this action.

Action 4.4. Task the PCHC with inviting local realtors and condo-conversion development specialists to engage in discussions over the potential for the condo-conversion process to create Affordable and Community Housing rather than reduce the stock of year-round housing available.

Local developers and realtors use condominium conversion law to meet the needs of vacation-home buyers. If even one Realtor or developer was willing to put their considerable skill and experience to using the condo-conversion process to help resolve the problem, it would create a partnership that could utilize the financial and political support to compete more effectively when properties became available for conversion.

5. ENGAGING THE SECOND HOME COMMUNITY

In community-housing consultant John Ryan's view, Provincetown's second home community holds the key to the town's future, for better or for worse. This element of the community possesses organizational capacity, political influence, and financial means far beyond what exists among the town's year-round residents. By tapping a common love for the community and what it stands for; understanding and respected each other's needs and motivations; and creating meaningful opportunities to deepen a sense of belonging and investment in the community, residents can ensure that their influence creates a better Provincetown. No investment in time or effort; no change in policy or shift in tax burden has greater potential to address Provincetown's Affordable and Community Housing need than a sincere investment in making second homeowners true partners in the community.

Action 5.1. Task the CHC, the PHA and the Council on Aging (COA), with beginning a dialogue with the Provincetown Part-time Resident Tax Payers Association (PPRTPA) and other second homeowners about the critical housing issues that Provincetown faces and to discuss ways that the second home community could engage more meaningfully in helping realize a thriving year-round community that addresses the core interest of both seasonal and year-round residents.

Such discussions are already underway but need to remain a focus of the CHC until such time as an entity emerges with the specific mission of fostering partnership between the year-round and second home communities.

Action 5.2. Task the CHC, BOS and the leadership of the (PPRTPA) and other second homeowners with exploring the possibility of holding a community gathering with its second home community (similar to that done in Eastham) sometime in the summer of 2014, that includes a community forum intended to kick off a concerted effort to engage the second home community in helping realize the town's vision for a viable year-round community, especially as it relates to Affordable and Community Housing needs.

This action is a time-sensitive and thus prioritized part of that dialogue.

Action 5.3. Task Provincetown's Housing Specialist with examining appropriate vehicles including the Affordable Housing Trust Fund to deliver tax-deductible benefits for any charitable giving that may arise from partnership with the second home community.

One motivation for building a stronger partnership with the second-home community is to seek their financial help in addressing the cost of creating community-housing opportunities. This action ensures that an effective structure exists to seek and receive charitable giving.

6. CONNECTING OWNERS AND RENTERS

A series of cost-effective strategies can alleviate some of the stress in knowing whether a prospective tenant (or landlord for that matter) represents a good match. These strategies are aimed at speeding up the exchange of information, providing supports that help reduce the psychological barriers to opening up one's home to a stranger. The actions address needs of seasonal and year-round renters, older residents, and second homeowners differently, as follows:

Action 6.1 Task the CHC with inviting CHR, the Cape Cod Landlords Association, Connecting Owners and Renters Working Group, and PPRTPA to discuss the option of some new or existing entity serving to assist both potential homeowners looking to mitigate the risks of renting and to qualified renters seeking appropriate housing.

This action is aimed at creating an entity to deliver incentives for potential landlords already in our midst with speedy education and access to resources, bureaucratic assistance and financial rewards, specifically:

- Streamline the renting process by acting as liaison between renters and potential landlords;
- Education: Providing programs for existing and prospective landlords;
- Referral: directing potential landlords to state resources, like the Cape Cod Landlord's Association, which offers seminars in vetting rental applicants and doing reference and credit checks;
- Matching: Establish a web-based matching program for renters and landlords to find each other, like a tenant adoption database; and
- Program Employees: Helping address the specific housing needs of J-1 and H2B employees.

Action 6.2 Task the CHC with examining the viability of creating a fund-raised indemnity fund.

This fund would help new second-home owners who take the initiative to rent seasonally or year-round to year-round residents recover at least some of the un-recouped costs resulting from damage caused by tenants.

Action 6.3 Task the Connecting Owners and Renters Working Group and the CHC with identifying the issues, process and structure of establishing a homesharing program.

7. FUNDING THE EFFORT

There is the clear recognition that the cost of reaching these targets that are necessary to ensuring a viable year-round community are great. There is no single or even multiple sources of money at this point to fund this effort. The following actions represent a start in identifying new sources of financing needed to create community-housing opportunities in Provincetown going forward. The task of continuing to seek funding to make these actions happen will be ongoing.

Action 7.1. Task the CHC, CPC, BOS and Provincetown Finance Committee with supporting a Town Meeting warrant article to once again reserve 60% of CPA funds for Affordable and Community Housing uses.

Current restrictions provide that 10% of CPA funds be dedicated to affordable housing initiatives, 10% for historic preservation initiatives, 10% for open space/recreation initiatives and the remaining 70% undesignated and available for any category. While flexibility currently exists in utilizing 70% of CPA funds, it is suggested that the allocation of CPA funds to affordable housing initiatives be maximized. It is understood that this initiative is already in process.

Action 7.2. Task the CHC, BOS and Provincetown Finance Committee with supporting a Town Meeting warrant article to reserve the revenue from any expansion of the rooms tax or the realization of any real estate transfer tax to be dedicated to Affordable and Community Housing purposes.

Action 7.3 Task the CHC with soliciting interest in the creation of an organization dedicated to Affordable and Community Housing fundraising

Currently, there are major fundraising events held during various times throughout the year. The principal beneficiaries include ASGCC, HOW and SKIP, each highly deserving organizations providing valuable services to the community. ASGCC and HOW also include an element of affordable housing within their mission. However, there is a lack of comparable fundraising events held which are devoted entirely to affordable housing. Consider, for example, the 2013 Halloween Beaux Arts Ball. While Town residents are among the attendees at this event, many attendees also come from outside the community. Such an event held for affordable housing initiatives could draw donor dollars from outside the community that are currently not being captured.

Another concept -- Adopt-A-Project -- envisions an initiative to combine community outreach with targeted, personalized fundraising projects. For example, a specific individual or family situation could be spotlighted, in a manner which protects their personal identity if appropriate. The spotlight could explain the current situation, the goal to be accomplished and the amount of money and effort it would take to reach that goal. By personalizing situations, it

helps to “put a name or a face” to the housing crisis and can spur action and hopefully financial contributions that might not otherwise be made.

Action 7.4. Task the Provincetown Town Manager with determining the feasibility of providing for a voluntary donation check box on property tax bills.

APPENDICES

- Appendix A. Listing of Participants attending each Housing Summit meeting and those who voted on the Housing Action Plan approved on February 28, 2014
- Appendix B. Provincetown’s Community Housing Inventory, 2014
- Appendix C. The 2013 Provincetown’s Housing Needs Assessment prepared by John Ryan, Development Cycles
- Appendix D. Matrix of Proposed Housing Actions

HOUSING ACTION PLAN

DRAFT

APPENDIX B

Provincetown Community Housing Units

Massachusetts Department of Housing & Community Development Chapter 40B Subsidized Housing Inventory			
Town of Provincetown <i>as of 2/18/14</i>	<i>2/1/2014 DHCD Certified</i>		
Property	40B Units rental	40B Units ownership	Year end
Harry Kemp Way [Ch 667-1, Housing Authority]	24		perpetuity
Pearl/Court [Ch 705-1, Housing Authority]	5		perpetuity
Harry Kemp Way [Ch 705-2, Housing Authority]	4		perpetuity
214 Bradford Street [Foley House]	10		2036
27A Conwell Street	5		2017
Housing Rehab Program		7	2017-2021
35 Conwell St [Hensche estates]		7	2041
27 Nelson Avenue	2		2031
56 West Vine Street		1	2042
24 Captain Bertie's Way		5	2041
32 Conwell Street	18		2042
56B West Vine Street		1	2042
83 Shank Painter Rd	15		perpetuity
139 Bradford Street	1		2041
5 Fritz's Way [Habitat]		2	2053
122 Bradford St Ext [Meadows]	5	9	perpetuity
40A Nelson Ave	6		2103
54-58 Harry Kemp Way	4		2054
Herring Cove Village		3	perpetuity
90 Shank Painter Rd [Province Landing]	50		perpetuity
			<i>8.67%</i>
total SHI units	149	35	184

Note that the SHI currently double counts 5 of the 83SP units

Deed Restricted Units NOT on SHI			
48 Race Point Rd		1	perpetuity
68 Race Point Rd		1	perpetuity
34- 36 Conwell St		1	2045
CEM Care Campus	9		perpetuity
Sandy Hill		4	
total non-SHI Deed Restricted units	9	7	

GRAND TOTAL	158	42	200
--------------------	------------	-----------	------------

Affordable Housing Tax Exemption

Fiscal Year	No. Properties	No. Units	Tax Amount
2004	21	46	\$32,110
2005	31	55	\$51,902
2006	25	56	\$48,955
2007	30	60	\$57,167
2008	33	63	\$70,103
2009	31	61	\$64,620
2010	25	54	\$50,606
2011	24	46	\$49,707
2012	23	43	\$46,723
2013	24	92	\$60,728

