

**TOWN OF PROVINCETOWN - BOARD OF SELECTMEN
MEETING MINUTES
JOINT MEETING WITH THE VISITOR SERVICES BOARD
MONDAY, AUGUST 28, 2017 5:00 PM
TOWN HALL – JUDGE WELSH ROOM**

Chair Cheryl Andrews convened the meeting at 5:00 pm noting the following:

Board of Selectmen: Cheryl Andrews, Robert Anthony, Tom Donegan and Erik Yingling

Excused: Louise Venden

Other attendees: Town Manager David Panagore, Asst. Town Manager David Gardner, Board Secretary Elizabeth Paine, Tourism Director Anthony Fuccillo and Assistant Tourism Director Radu Luca.

Red Thread Director Nadine Licostie

Recorder: Elizabeth Paine

VSB Chair Murray called the VSB to order at 5:00 pm.

Visitor Services Board: Chair Richard Murray, Regina Cassidy, Susan Avellar, Jay Gurewitsch and Robert Sanborn.

Excused: Lesley Marchessault, Vice Chair

1. Round table Discussion with the Visitor Services Board to discuss the marketing initiative.

BOS Chair Andrews opened by saying that this is the third meeting this summer and the first two were to hear from the marketing specialist Nadine Lacostie. At this point, she turned the meeting over to Ms. Lacostie.

Ms Lacostie began with this slide.



She stated that when you look at any situation you will see that there is commonality with other

areas. So they decided to take a look at global tourism. She mentioned the UN sustainable goals and a document from Deloitte.

She put up this slide and read it.



The future is bright

- Global tourism sector will outperform the global economy over the course of the next ten years.
- Travel and tourism directly employs¹
 - 7 times more than automotive manufacturing
 - 5 times more than the global chemicals industry
 - 4 times more than the global banking industry
 - 4 times more than the global mining industry
 - Almost 2 times more than the global financial services industry

1. <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2017/08/the-growth-paradox-can-tourism-ever-be-sustainable/>

3

We are in that big group she said. We can talk brightly about the future of a place like Provincetown. Our first meeting was very broad. I would like today's meeting to have more dialogue.

She then asked if there were any overarching questions from the group.

Jay asked how the Deloitte report is relevant to us.

Nadine said that her point of view is that her work has specific responsibilities. She said there are just over 500 licensed businesses in town each working on their own marketing and so in today's world, our visitors ARE connected and they have a certain expectation. We should look at what is going on around the world. We can learn from it. For example, is there information we can give our businesses to help them be more successful? We should look at other places that are struggling with the "seasonality" issue. Best Practices. She then read this slide to us.



What travelers want

- Consumers want authenticity, personalization, removal of friction, and on-demand functionality in their travel experiences.
- Today, more people travel for culture, food, art, and safety than ever before.
- Responsible/sustainable travel is a goal of the UN and citizens around the globe.
- Tourism promotes exchanges between people from different parts of the world, strengthening understanding between cultures and fostering peace between communities and nations.²

2 http://cf.cdn.umwts.org/sites/all/files/pdf/turismo_responsible_omit_acc.pdf

3

The rate of growth in the Tourism Industry is very great. People are mobile. Small businesses are being bought now and when they do, they are going to small corporations that use all digital. No paper. The rate of growth in Tourism is 3.3% annually. We are talking about a \$200 Million Dollar economy here in Provincetown.

Mr Panagore hears conversations in the community that we are competing with places like Spain. Not just Oqunquit. Or Newburyport.

Nadine stated yes, and those places have challenges as well, that we can learn from. She then put up this slide:

Provincetown tourism

- Provincetown tourism is an economic engine that provides \$200 million in revenue.
- Tourism has a direct effect on the organizations that are located in Provincetown, bringing national recognition and awareness to local nonprofits.
- What is good for Provincetown's fragile ecosystem is also good for the tourism business.
 - Renewable energy
 - Sustainable building
 - Protection of natural resources
- Provincetown tourism can align to the UN sustainable goals and promote:
 - Environmental education
 - Gender equality
 - Integration of people with disabilities
 - Preservation of culture and history

Nadine asked again for some feedback and background.

Tom Donegan agreed that it's important to look at this information. It divides for him into 2 parts . One, who wants to come here? And twosustaining repeat visitors. The challenge is how to find NEW visitors while protecting the base of visitors that we already have.

Susan Avellar than asked about the next slide that showed the 500 businesses.

500 Businesses

Art	Culinary	Lodging
Theater	Casual	Luxury
Fine art	Luxury	Adults-only
Photography	Foodie	Romantic
Video	Active	Seasonal
Music	Water sports	Family
Retail	Physical fitness	Campground
Fashion	Eco tours	Dog-friendly
Home furnishing	Cycling	Organization
Jewelry	Service	FAWC
Liquor	Spa	CCS
Gourmet	Hair & Makeup	Meeting House
Eclectic	Pets	HRC
Hardware		PAAM
Thrift		Pilgrim Monument

and asked why there were not any marine-based services listed. We have two marinas plus 2 maybe 3 mooring fields. She thinks they should be listed.

Nadine said it was not left out in her thinking. She said the approach here is holistic. You're right. It's not listed. It can be updated.

Regina Cassidy stated that we have a new market coming in , with a lot of money..and we need to ask ourselves what are they looking for? People are coming in, in private yachts and staying in town or in private planes.

Cheryl: is this list just business that caters to tourists?

Nadine: this is from the licensing dept.

Cheryl: ok, that's why all the health institutions are left out.

Nadine: we are looking at how we get more people in to visit. And how do these groups interrelate.

Rick Murray: he thinks what Tom said is how he is thinking. How do we reinforce to our repeat visitors to keep coming.....they can come back 8 times a year. Also, the second home owners too. The new visitors? We need a new group. That's the challenge. How much do we put into THAT bucket? For us to get that new, younger generation is a challenge.

Tom: Mentioned that we have a number of different "economies"...including the BLUE economy and we can look at all of them.

Nadine said yes, that is what we are trying to do. She mentioned Monterey's aquarium and their fishing stickers as marketing tools.

Robert Anthony agrees with what he is hearing but....the NPS attract over 100,000 people a season. We are surrounded by the NPS. But, how many of those people come into our town? Maybe it might be nice to have the park service here at the table.

Cheryl mentioned she sees a lot of folks in the park, that don't really know much about the Town.

Nadine: yes, we should look at that group. She then put up this slide.

Mission and message

The mission of the Visitor Services Board and the Provincetown Tourism Office is to market, beautify and enhance tourism in Provincetown.

And then read and reviewed this one.

Mission and message

The goals we set to achieve our mission

- Maximize opportunities to market the Provincetown brand as a place deeply rooted in a culture of creativity, self-expression, history and heritage. A place where everyone belongs.
- Work in real time to update tactics and pursue goals that bring awareness of Provincetown as the quintessential year round American resort town
- Reach out to national and international audiences eager to find authentic destinations for vacation and living.
- Develop sustainable and responsible planning that aligns with UN goals.

We need to know that we are offering what people want. We need to survey our visitors to know who they are. The UN is a global body and she said let's talk about the UN Goals. There are 17..... 6 or 7 that pertain to us. She turned us to page 22 of the hand out.



FROM THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS (MDGs) TO THE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS (SDGs)

In September 2000, the 189 member countries of the United Nations signed a global alliance that materialized in the establishment of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Among the goals set were to eradicate extreme poverty and world hunger, achieve universal primary education, ensure environmental sustainability and develop a global partnership for development. This alliance came to an end in 2015 and despite the efforts and advances, the achievement of the goals was uneven.

The 15 years of work on the MDGs revealed major difficulties for their achievement, such as: the importance of identifying sources of funding, the establishment of appropriate indicators to measure progress, and the lack of clarity about the role of certain actors in achieving the agenda, such as civil society and the private sector.

With these lessons learned, in January 2012, the Secretary-General of the United Nations, Ban Ki-moon, established a task force to support the preparation of the Post-2015 Agenda. This team brought together more than 60 institutions and agencies of the United Nations family and other international organizations. The conclusions of this work were presented in June 2012 at the UN Conference on Sustainable Development (Rio + 20), one of the most important global meetings on sustainable development of our time, under the theme "The future we want. From then on, the



THE SDGs AND THE COMPANIES OF THE TOURISM SECTOR

2015 has become a landmark year for sustainability, being the year in which governments agreed to adopt the post-2015 development agenda. The new agenda is transformative, as it focuses on people and contains bold and ambitious goals. The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) that build on and expand the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), whose implementation ended in 2015, comprise 17 goals and 169 targets and will serve as the framework for the new global development agenda for the next fifteen years.

Tourism can contribute directly or indirectly to all these Goals. Specifically, tourism appears in the targets of Goals 8, 12 and 14, which relate, respectively, to inclusive and sustainable economic development, sustainable consumption and production, and sustainable use of oceans and marine resources.

Sustainable tourism is firmly positioned in the post-2015 development agenda. To accomplish this agenda, however, a clear implementation framework is needed, with adequate

funding and investment in technology, infrastructure and human resources.¹⁰



Goal 8, promotes "sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all" and includes target 8.9:

"by 2030, devise and implement policies to promote sustainable tourism that creates jobs and promotes local culture and products".

¹⁰ Tourism and the SDGs (Madrid: UNWTO, 2015)

She mentioned discussion she had heard at the BofS level about Economic Development and that plays right into the UN Goals. Also, responsible consumption and production.



Goal 12, aims at "ensuring sustainable Consumption and Production patterns". It comprises target 12.2:

-Develop and implement tools to monitor sustainable development impacts for sustainable tourism which creates jobs, promotes local culture and products-



The focus of Goal 14 is to "conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development". The target 14.7 reads:

-by 2030 increase the economic benefits of SIDS and LDCs from the sustainable use of marine resources, including through sustainable management of fisheries, aquaculture and tourism-

72

She discussed both 12 and 14. And then gender equality.

Another challenge is relative to the field of the **environment**. Tourism activities can cause impacts on ecosystems, so it is necessary to promote the efficient management of resources and to support measures against climate change.

Responsible production and consumption are also considered key challenges, with regard to both the supply chain of the companies of the sector and the promotion of sustainable consumption patterns among tourists.

Creating **partnerships** and opportunities for dialogue between different actors, such as companies, governments, civil society and the education sector, is essential in order to promote knowledge-sharing and to multiply the impact.

An additional challenge is related to the need for **transparency** processes in the organizations of the sector, promoting the preparation of sustainability reports.

Furthermore, it is important to preserve destinations and to promote **sustainable and smart cities** that benefit local people and tourists.

Lastly, the sustainable management of **supply chains** is a key issue for ensuring the sustainability of the sector, particularly in relation with the assessment, training and contracting of suppliers.

The 13 companies participating in this project have highlighted

five Sustainable Development Goals they consider priorities for the tourism sector in Spain: Goals 5, 8, 11, 13 and 17.



-Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls-

Promote measures to guarantee the same labor rights and opportunities for women.



-Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all-

The tourism industry can give access to decent work opportunities, particularly in developing countries.

26

Because the economy here has been mostly seasonal...we need to discuss how the wages of women affects tourism here.

Jay asked if gender disparity in pay is a local issue...do we have data.

Susan mentioned that a lot of the children that go to the Sailing Program choose to because it's a way for women to leave their kids at school, while they work.

Regina mentioned that she works in payroll and the answer is ...yes. Most all housekeepers are women. In restaurants, the women are in the back of the kitchen.

Cheryl asked about the UN Goals. She mentioned that we have an “International Flair” here whether because of our summer workers or because of our summer visitors. She stated she would like to see that be supported. We should welcome diverse cultures. People say our town is diverse...but in reality...we were do look a lot alike.

Nadine stated that it is Goal 11.



-Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable-

Promoting smarter and greener cities can attract tourists and also benefit residents.



-Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development-

Public-public cooperation and multi stakeholder partnerships are necessary to delivery on the post-2015 Development Agenda. A global commitment is necessary.



-Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts-

Reducing greenhouse gas emissions to guarantee the sustainability of the tourism sector and preserve destinations benefiting both tourists and local communities.



Rick mentioned that this is one of the reasons the VSB hired Nadine. Because she mentioned how we can attract international visitors and how we should tell our stories to them. And then mentioned we had 10 minutes left today.

Nadine agreed and said context of these stories is key.

She mentioned that there are things that happen in the fall, specifically fund raising...that speak to who we are as a people. The younger visitors want to do things that are interesting and exciting.

So, getting tactical. She put up page 3 from the beginning of the handout.

Let's get tactical

- Utilize digital tools to maximize communication and storytelling opportunities developing responsive website/mobile, social media and activating media opportunities.
 - Using video, podcasts, digital and print collateral, to develop an approach where every story resonates with its audience.
- Deepen the relationship with local businesses and organizations to focus attention and leverage marketing efforts.
- Develop sustainable and responsible planning that align to UN goals.
- Share best practices and marketing materials.
- Leverage media messaging and spending through coordinated tactics.
- Ensure the success of established events and develop new ideas with local entrepreneurs.

3

She read and discussed this slide.

Are there any questions? Thoughts? Comments?

Rick asked if Tony wanted to talk about a vote on Monday August 21 to discuss the new messaging and visual identity of Provincetown which includes a spectrum of color. He stated the VSB voted for it.

Tom asked: about the original versions of this that included an image of the monument. Asked if using the rainbow colors this becomes exclusionary? Do we have enough information to say this should be it ...or why didn't the VSB use different images?

Nadine said we have only 5 minutes but my strong recommendation is to use one image. This is a watercolor and a spectrum and speaks to the Arts Community. The idea of a spectrum, well the folks out in the world see it as a rainbow, others see it not as LGBT but as ...a rainbow. I would caution and encourage people to look at it and say ..What does it mean that we are not out there saying...We are LGBT welcoming. If you look at this and say its only one thing, we whitewash our culture. That's unfortunate. I do think it's a beacon. It's a diverse coalition of people. And we should embrace the LGBT culture. We will keep testing it. To see that it is not exclusionary.

Regina: it was a 4-2 vote. I voted no. I feel it doesn't send an inclusive message.

Cheryl: the Chairs of these 2 boards are responsible for seeing that this meeting finish before 6pm tonight.

I can only say that when I looked at it, I thought.."Gay flag." So I went back and watched your meeting...and for over an hour, you folks went back and forth..."It's a gay flag, no it's not a gay flag. It's a gay flag. It's not a gay flag." I hear what you are saying. I will go home and watch this all again, but I have a lot of concerns about how the VSB is approaching the next 20 years relative to the last 20 years. We haven't talked about them yet. I think this one decision here will facilitate a good conversation. Not only should we NOT white wash what this is or what we are, but we should also NOT white wash an honest conversation about how we are spending all this

tax money. And we can't do that now, because we have a meeting at 6 o'clock.

I believe the BofS will wish to have a conversation with your board about this, and if we are big kids, than after that, hopefully we will walk out understanding each other's point of view better than we do now. And with that, unless anyone has a reason,

Rick mentioned at this point that the VSB vote was 4-2.

Cheryl: I'm going to entertain a motion to adjourn from the BofS

<http://view.earthchannel.com/PlayerController.aspx?&PGD=provincetv&eID=1070>

Without objection the meeting was adjourned at 5:59 pm

Minutes transcribed by: Elizabeth Paine