

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
PUBLIC MEETING
Town Hall
Provincetown MA
WEDNESDAY, MAY 15, 2019

Members Present: Thomas Biggert (TB), Chairman, Pilgrim Monument Rep.; Laurie Delmolino (LD), Historical Commission Rep.; Hersh Schwartz (HS), Chamber of Commerce Rep.; Christopher Mathieson (CM), PAAM Rep.; Michela Carew-Murphy (MCM), Alternate; Martin Risteen (MR), Alternate.

Excused Absence: John Dowd, PGB Rep.

Others Present: Annie Howard (AH), Building Commissioner.

Work Session: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN

1. Commission Elections

AH confirmed for TB that all sitting Historic District Board members vote, including Alternates, but that Alternates cannot be nominees.

MCM nominated TB as Chair of the HDC. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; MCM, LD, HS, CM, MR.

HS nominated LD as Vice-Chair of the HDC. TB seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; HS, TB, CM, MCM, MR.

MCM nominated HS as Clerk of the HDC. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; MCM, LD, TB, CM, MR.

2. Update on potential violations reported to the Building Commissioner.

AH said she didn't have any updates on violations, but reported that CM has to take his ethics test, which can be found online.

3. Determination as to whether the applications below involve any Exterior Architectural Features within the jurisdiction of the Commission; with Full Reviews to be placed on the Public Hearing agenda of June 5, 2019 and Administrative Reviews to be acted on by a subcommittee appointed by the Commission.

TB made a motion to consider the following as Full Review:

iv) 261 Bradford St.; viii) 17 W. Vine St.; ix) 2 & 2A Conway St.; x) 25 Watson's Ct.; xi) 397 Commercial St.; xii) 7 Bradford St., Cottage; xiii) 101 Commercial St.; xiv) 31 Bradford St.; xv) 19 Ryder St. Ext.

HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, HS, LD, CM, MCM.

- i. [7 Carver](#) (continued from the meeting of May 1st) – To remove and replace an entry and screen door.
Tom Fitzgerald presented; distributed rendering of new door which he confirmed was wood. CM asked TB if this was the model he had referred to as the Ptown Door. TB said not necessarily. LD said it was an improvement and MCM said she'd be happy to approve.
TB made a motion to accept as Administrative Review. MCM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, MCM, LD, HS, CM.
TB made a motion to approve as presented with the condition the door be wood. MCM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, MCM, LD, HS, CM.
 - ii. [353B Commercial St., U15](#) – To add to a rubber roof.
No one presented.
TB made a motion to accept as Administrative Review. MCM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, MCM, LD, HS, CM.
TB made a motion to approve as presented. MCM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, MCM, LD, HS, CM.
 - iii. [426 Commercial St.](#) – To replace a rubber roof.
No one presented,
TB read letter concerning emergency repair to the roof from Peter Paige.
TB made a motion to accept as Administrative Review. MCM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, MCM, LD, HS, CM.
TB made a motion to approve as presented. MCM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, MCM, LD, HS, CM.
 - v. [6 Winthrop St.](#) – To replace a deck and siding in kind.
No one presented.
TB noted captured balusters.
TB made a motion to accept as Administrative Review. MCM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, MCM, LD, HS, CM.
TB made a motion to approve as presented. MCM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, MCM, LD, HS, CM.
 - vi. [188 Bradford St.](#) – To replace 15 windows, trim and siding.
No one presented.
AH referenced previous work done on the premises; said this is phase II where work already done concerned the back side where windows have been replaced in conjunction with a kitchen re-model. File number is **HDC 19-254**.
TB made a motion to accept as Administrative Review. MCM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, MCM, LD, HS, CM.
TB made a motion to approve as presented. MCM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, MCM, LD, HS, CM.
 - vii. [615 Commercial St.](#) – To replace siding.
No one presented.
TB made a motion to accept as Administrative Review. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, CM, MCM.
TB made a motion to approve as presented with the condition that all trim be wood. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, CM, MCM.
- 4. Any other business that shall properly come before the Commission:**

Angela McCarthy of 199 Bradford St. presented Ricardo Torres of Versatex with a request to use Versatex as her building material instead of Boral, which Ms. McCarthy offered was a high-quality component. Mr. Torres passed around two models, said the product is an American-made PVC composite which is 50% salt-based and a combination of other ingredients which Mr. Torres said is found in TUMS, and which allows for contracting and expansion. Ms. McCarthy displayed a picture from her computer notebook of the desired look.

AH commented on the product, saying it is one of several composite brands names, as is Azek which, she said, probably expands the most; said Versatex was used for the dental clinic at Outer Cape Health. TB asked Mr. Torres to express some of the differences in product choice. Mr. Torres responded that Boral is a by-product of a by-product which is, itself, a by-product of coal whereas Versatex is salt-based with a similar density to pine but a far greater lifespan; said Versatex is LEED (Leadership in Energy & Environmental Design)-certified and is a Green company which re-cycles a lot.

LD said the reason they have allowed Boral is due to its close look to wood, whether painted or finished; expressed her hesitancy to approve something that looks so perfect and plastic. Mr. Torres said the embossed look is not a popular look in New England as that market prefers the smooth finish. Ms. McCarthy noted that Boral is involved in a lawsuit and she can't be comfortable going with a company she may not be able to rely upon. Ms. McCarthy then suggested a carcinogen link to which AH said was a statement that needed to be substantiated.

MCM said it felt lighter than wood and agreed with Ms. McCarthy that after a few paint jobs it would have a closer look to wood; said she appreciated having a better product for the environment.

CM said he agreed with the points raised by MCM, but that in imagining an entire house built with this material he is hesitant to approve. MR noted that the HDC had already approved Boral and asked Mr. Torres to qualify the green categorization. Mr. Torres said, in addition to their certification they are registered with the Green Homebuilders' Association and that they're recycling is at about 30%, including pulling from landfills.

TB stated his opposition as the HDC would be shooting down Azek if the applicant was before the Board with that option and cautioned against approving a too-perfect product that robs the home of its imperfections which, in time, help to give the Town its patina. MCM asked if a portion of the product could be painted and then expressed to the Board for observation. Ms. McCarthy said she would comply and return at a future meeting with the results.

AH recommended a site visit to the dental facility to experience the application of Versatex; noted that the clinic building was painted in 2013 and said all composites hold paint very well.

5. **Public Comments:** On any matter not on the agenda below.
None.

6. **Public Hearing: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN**

TB opened the Public Hearing at 4:10pm.

- a) [HDC 19-200](#) (continued from the meeting of May 1st)
Application by **Don DiRocco**, of **Hammer Architects**, on behalf of **Steven Tait & David Cook**, requesting to renovate an existing three-story structure, including replacing and relocating windows and doors, constructing a new front porch and a new deck on the south elevation and to demolish a portion of the existing building that is encroaching on

the east elevation lot line and reconstruct it on a new foundation on the property located at **425 Commercial Street**.

Steven Tait, David Cook, Don DiRocco and **Mark Hammer** presented,

Mr. Tait said he followed up on the HDC's suggestion and put the cottage as available for ownership up on Facebook where he got some good responses; all three however who looked into it, dropped out after checking in with engineers and movers. TB said he had figured it might prove a logistical nightmare.

TB read into the record Sarah Korjef's letter dated May 7, 2019 from the Cape Cod Commission wherein she stated that after careful review of the application, the HDC has good grounds to grant a certificate of appropriateness if the HDC does not require salvaging any parts of the building under the new application. Ms. Korjef based her conclusion upon consideration that both buildings would qualify as non-contributing although she felt the project should have qualified from the outset as a demolition after a clear determination of the 25% guideline.

LD recused herself from the room as she was not at the prior decision.

Mr. DiRocco presented new changes made per HDC's recommendations. MR asked about the percentage as cited in Ms. Korjef's letter to which AH said the Zoning definition for demolition had already been approved and today's vote by the HDC would satisfy the qualification for demolition.

TB made a motion to approve the application with the plans dated May 8, 2019. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, HS, CM, MCM, MR.

b) [HDC 19-237](#)

Application by **Diane Burcz** requesting to add and replace windows, siding, a front entry door, pilasters and a deck, including reducing its size and replacing the existing decking with Azek and natural cedar, on the south elevation and to replace an existing door with a sliding patio door and decking material with Azek and natural cedar on the north elevation of the property located at **252 Bradford Street**.

Diane Burcz, property owner, and **Charles Navratil** presented.

Ms. Burcz noted budget concerns don't permit her from doing Anderson window replacements about the whole house, but they would attend to the back in time.

David Maril of 256 Bradford Street spoke in favor; said his family used to rent no. 252, gave brief historical background in citing a restaurant, Mary's Chowder Bowl, once occupied the property.

Stephanie Vevers spoke in support as a neighbor at 250 Bradford, and on behalf of her mother, Elsbeth.

TB and the HDC agreed the rear could not be seen from a public way.

Mr. Navratil handed out a color diagram. Ms. Burcz said the door would be a composite, but TB said he felt a wood door would be required, and requested a tear-sheet on the door. Ms. Burcz said they've maintained the tin ceilings, thin plank Maplewood floor and all five-paneled doors, although some are not in good shape; said house is from 1890, but TB remarked that the MACRIS (Mass Cultural Resource Information System) listing has it at 1850, which Mr. Navratil said could account for its Greek Revival look.

CM said the pediment over the front door felt heavy and not unified with the windows. Mr. Navratil said that was intentional. TB agreed with CM in that the style of the door as proposed would not align with an 1850 look, suggested the so-named Provincetown Door which, he said, does have panels. CM and LD disagreed, noting the Provincetown Door as a later century fixture. Ms. Burcz said the existing door is probably from the 1980s and that she preferred a solid door.

LD said she was fine with the windows, felt they were working to make the building more historical, said typically Azek is not allowed for the trim. Ms. Burcz said the Azek proposed is for the deck and the railing and painted wood for other elements. LD gave a suggestion for the door that, she said, was not far off from what is there now,

agreed that the pediment looked heavy.

MCM checked on e-Bay and located a Greek Revival door for \$595. CM commented that Greek Revival is usually associated with 6-over-6 windows, many of which, AH added, are gone now, replaced often with 2-over-2s. Ms. Burcz said she preferred the look of 2-over-2s after searching around options. LD referenced a Marvin window that could be suitable. AH said other options might be working the price point.

TB requested the applicant return with a new door design, detailed trim and casing. Ms. Burcz asked after Hardie Plank, which LD said is not historic and TB requested wood shingles or clapboards. Ms. Burcz said she was concerned with maintenance as her husband just passed and he was the one who worked the outside.

TB made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of June 5, 2019. CM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, CM, LD, HS, MR.

HDC informed Ms. Burcz she had an option of 4 or 6 panel doors. MCM texted Ms. Burcz some door samples that she had located on e-Bay for her consideration.

8. Deliberations on Pending Decisions: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN

HDC 19-200, 425 Commercial Street. TB made a motion to approve the decision of May 15, 2019 as written and read by MCM. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, CM, MCM.

7. Review and approval of Minutes.

TB made a motion to approve the minutes of March 20, 2019, April 3, 2017 and April 17, 2019. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, HS, LD, CM, MCM.

AH dispersed items to be signed, including 18 Commercial St., 342 Commercial St., 24 Pearl St., 15 Atwood Avenue and 286 Commercial St.

Per HS, **HDC 19-216**, 137 Bradford St., decision of April 17, 2019 was filed on May 7, 2019; and **HDC 19-011**, 577 Commercial St., decision of September 5, 2018 was filed on May 14, 2019.

TB made a motion to adjourn at 5:03pm MCM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, MCM, LD, HS, CM.

Respectfully Submitted,
Jody O'Neil