

**The Provincetown Historic District Commission
Wednesday, February 08, 2006, Town Hall, 260**

Meeting Minutes

Members present: John Dowd, Clo Tepper, Carol Neal, Polly Burnell, Marcene Marcoux and Nathan Butera.

Members absent: None

Staff present: Maxine Notaro, Doug Taylor

Work Session 3:45 pm

Administrative Review

67 Bradford Street

John Reis, Inc. on behalf of Michael McIntyre of 67 Bradford Street for demolition existing office building and construct a new building in same footprint.

After a short discussion, the board members felt a full review would be required.

1 High Pole Hill Road

John Reis, Inc. on behalf of Cape Cod Pilgrim Memorial Association to demolition and reconstruct the entranceway. The newly constructed entrance way will have the same roof pitch as the existing.

Moved – John Dowd moved to approve as presented.

Seconded – Carol Neal seconded the motion.

Vote – 4 in favor John Dowd, Carol Neal, Polly Burnell and Marcene Marcoux with one abstention – Clo Tepper.

127 Bradford Street

Michael Czyoski presented an application for siding replacement to be of hardi-board. The west side of the building was previously approved using hardi-board and now the property owners would like to match the east side to that of the west elevation.

Mr. Czyoski said one side of the building is already hardi-board and there would be no consistency if the Board will not allow what was previously approved on the other side.

The Commissioners said that they previously approved hardi-board but after seeing how it severely alters historic buildings they do not feel that they can continue to approve it on historically significant buildings over 50 years old.

Carol Neal said the cement board does not weather the same as clapboard and referred to HDC guideline 12. Siding which states synthetic siding is generally discouraged because it severely compromises the appearance and integrity of historic buildings and will only be approved on a case-by-case basis.

The board members felt there is a great difference between a reproduction and the actual materials and they try to preserve what is natural.

The board members denied the request for hardi-board.

90 Commercial Street

The windows were not addressed the way they were presented. A site visit was scheduled for noon on 2/9/06.

2006-07 Withdrawn without prejudice

Application by Tom Thompson for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to amend previously approved plans to cover first floor decks with porches at the property located at **3 Fishburn Court, Provincetown,**

MA.

2006-04 (Continued to February 22, 2006)

Application by Regina Binder on behalf of Alex Mazzocca and Glen Martin for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for approximately a 1300 square foot addition to a freestanding 2-story cottage at the property located at **15 Brewster Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Public Hearings

2006-05 (Continued from 1/25/06) Revised plans for Main House and Garage/Cottage

Application by Thomas Shirk and Thomas Bantle for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown for the property located at **7 Johnson Street, Provincetown, MA.** *2006-05 (Continued from 1/25/06) Revised plans for Main House and Garage/Cottage*

Members sitting were Clo Tepper, Nathan Butera, John Dowd, Polly Burnell and Marcene Marcoux.

Main House - John DeSouza said they reduced the tower to 2' with an increase on the south elevation to even the look. The applicants requested a skylight be installed on the north elevation for some light in that area of the building.

North elevation – The designers discussed the band design on the building. They brought the band around the back and dove it into the corner board. The band on the front west continues around to the north.

Cottage – Mr. DeSouza said the property owners would like to increase the height of the cottage to accommodate the relocation of the stairs from the outside to the inside. The building was designed to look like a Cape garage. The windows will be 6/6 and the dormer is also needed due to the stair relocation.

The door on the north elevation was relocated to allow for a railing design. There is minimal roof height to this building.

Polly Burnell felt that 2/2 windows were better suited for this structure.

John Dowd said the 2/2 windows in the dormer make the building appear to look like more mass. The 6/6 windows reduce the mass.

Mr. DeSouza said the 2/1 windows would have a more casual look. The proportion of the windows should be uniform.

Marcene Marcoux said the guidelines speak to keeping the old design.

John Dowd said the railing system looks too thin and spindly. Should make sure they are not insubstantial when installing.

Two letters in favor abutters at 5 & 9 Arch Street were read into the record.

Moved – John Dowd moved to accept the proposed alterations of February 8, 2006 as follows:

- Proposed south elevation on the main house corner boards in the tower structure to be widened to the width of the supporting columns below
- 4 windows in the tower building on the south elevation view have no clapboards between the windows
- Rear dormer on the south elevation – eliminate the bracket and caps over the window
- No clapboard in the dormer section
- The skylight is approved as presented
- The proposed tower go to the peak instead of the flat roof
- Ornamental tower be made of wood scroll serpentine form
- Banister design be re-submitted and approved by sub-committee

Cottage renovations

- The east dormer 6 light becomes a 2 light split

- 6/6 windows to be 2/1's
- The west elevation dormer windows go from 6/6 to 2/1
- First floor windows to be changed from 6/6 to 2/1

Seconded by Polly Burnell.

Voted unanimously. Polly Burnell, John Dowd, Clo Tepper, Marcene Marcoux and Nathan Butera. Carol Neal recused herself.

2006-13 104A Bradford Street

2006-13

Application by Elizabeth Brooke for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for the addition of a deck and glass doors to the south elevation; move a casement window and remove a double-hung window on the east elevation at the property located at **104A Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Sitting on the case were Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, John Dowd, Polly Burnell and Marcene Marcoux.

-
Voted – John Dowd moved to accept the plans as presented.

Seconded by Carol Neal. Voted unanimously. Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, John Dowd, Polly Burnell and Marcene Marcoux.

4 Dyer Street

2006-14

Application by Mark Kinnane of Cape Associates, Inc. on behalf of Gail Williams for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to replace all windows with Marvin insulated SDL windows; increase the size of the sunroom and change the windows to doors; increase the height of the second floor roof on the street side and rear driveway side; add or modify dormers; replace vinyl siding with hardi-board clapboard siding and re-roof the building at the property located at **4 Dyer Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Present were Peter Sweeney, Architect, Mark Kinnane, contractor, Vernon Brown, designer and Gail Williams, property owner.

Polly Burnell said the building was quite large and asked what the increase was.

Mark Kinnane said the scale units work out to be an increase of 9.1

Carol Neal said one request is to remove vinyl siding and replace with hardi-board.

Mr. Kinnane said after the earlier discussion on hardi-board he now has a different feeling.

Ms. Williams said the age of the building is estimated between 1850 and 1880.

The Board discussed the separation of the windows on the front elevation, which proved to be a result of the interior layout of the rooms.

Moved – John Dowd moved to accept the proposal with the following changes:

- Second floor windows on the gable end of the south elevation retain their original location.
- Applicant to submit future plan showing the addition of two attic 4-light windows to be approved by a sub-committee.
- East elevation – two attic lights in gable to be relocated lower and closer to the eave
- The two windows on the first floor under the north end change from 4 light to 2 light
- The building shall be clapboard and not hardi-board.

Seconded by Marcene Marcoux. Voted unanimously.

-
-

6 Mechanic Street

2006-12

Application by Michael Czyoski on behalf of Nikki Richer for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to replace three screens on the second story porch with two double hung windows to match existing at the property located at **6 Mechanic Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Sitting on the case was Nathan Butera, Clo Tepper, Carol Neal, John Dowd and Polly Burnell.

Moved – John Dowd moved to approve as presented with the following conditions:

- The two new windows be separated from each other
- The distance for the window on the right by the corner board is mirrored to the window furthest on the left to the corner board
- Add one window adjacent to the existing window

Seconded by Nathan Butera. Voted unanimously. Clo Tepper, Carol Neal, Nathan Butera, John Dowd and Polly Burnell.

543-545 Commercial Street

2006-16

Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Provincetown Hospitality, Inc. for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to remove a false front dormer; reconfigure the central front entry area; reconstruct railings; change cedar shakes on the north and south sides of the building to clapboard covering all exposed brick and cement block walls; reconfigure door and window layouts and install new; add windows on east and west sides; close off and convert portion of pedestrian passageway thru building into living space; convert continuous decks along south (ocean) side of the building to added living space and private balconies; add private gardens along the north side of the first floor at the property located at **543-545 Commercial Street, Building #2, Provincetown, MA.**

Neal Kimball said the proposed plan is to convert this building to residential and to update to the material and design for the area. The idea is to create a three-dimensional design. At the present time there are rows and rows of egresses. The proposal is to have two means of egress on the Commercial Street façade.

Proposed to eliminate the walkways along the rear of the building. The plans submitted show where they project and retract.

Carol Neal questioned the distance of the walkways and what the mass of the building was.

Neal Kimball said the walkways are 6' wide but will be reduced to 4 ½ feet.

Doug Taylor said the walkways are site plan issues and not historic purview.

John Dowd said he would like to see v-cut vertical boards used in the recessed panel bays.

Neal Kimball said they would be using cedar shakes, hardi-plank and white trim.

Doug Taylor asked Mr. Kimball what he meant by cedar shakes “would they be split or sawn?”

Neal Kimball said sawn. They are also requesting using hardi-plank on the waterside of the building which is the back of the building facing the bay. Also, a lot of emphasis will be placed on green area.

Doug Taylor asked is Chapter 91 has been applied for.

Mr. Kimball said it had been.

Nathan Butera said it was difficult to approve hardi-board in principal. However, it is probably the best thing to do on

this building because it is on the waterside and it is not an historical structure.

Neal Kimball said the hardi-plank is synthetic clapboard in which only 35% of that facade would be hardi-plank.

Marcene Marcoux had a different opinion on using hardi-board. It is her feeling that the Board should be consistent when approving or disapproving material of this type. This is not an historic structure but it is still in the district and is a significant building in mass.

Attorney Chris Snow said although this is not relevant to this case, this building went up illegally. At present, it's not the best of buildings to look at. The proposed plans are more pleasing to the neighborhood.

Moved – John Dowd moved to accept the plans with the following conditions:

- Recessed panels in the bay to be v-cut vertical
- Recessed panel pillars to be recessed equally on the sides and top and bottom
- Sharp pediment over the entryway door be removed and replaced with a replacement 3-part panel the width of the bay and railing
- Design of the following to be submitted and reviewed by a sub-committee
- Hardi-board is approved based on the fact this is a non-historic building less than 50 years of age and it is exposed to the waterfront.

Seconded – Polly Burnell seconded the motion.

Voted four in favor: Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd and Carol Neal with one abstention, Marcene Marcoux.

540-544 Commercial Street

2006-17

Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Provincetown Hospitality, Inc. for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to convert a flat roof to hip roof; reconstruct railings; change cedar shakes on the north and south side of the building to clapboard covering all exposed brick and cement block walls; reconfigure door and window layouts and install new; add windows on the west and west sides; close in and convert auto passageway thru building to living space; add private gardens along north and south sides of the first floor at the property located at **540-544 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Moved – John Dowd moved to accept the plans as presented with the following conditions:

- Recessed panels in the bay to be v-cut vertical
- Recessed panel pillars to be recessed equally on the sides and top and bottom

Seconded by Nathan Butera. Voted unanimously. (Clo Tepper, Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, John Dowd and Polly Burnell).

139A Bradford Street

2006-15

Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of David Kucher for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to alter the west side of the structure by adding two awning windows on the first floor and on awning window on the second floor at the property located at **139A Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Moved – John Dowd moved to approve with window in shed dormer with window to be square on point fixed 1-light and to be trimmed out to match existing;

Two awning windows to be replaced with double-hung.

Seconded by Polly Burnell. Voted unanimously by Marcene Marcoux, Polly Burnell, John Dowd, Carol Neal and Nathan Butera.

Administrative Review

184 Commercial Street

The commission members moved to approve the same size windows 4 equally spaced, light division 2/1.

14 Brewster Street

Moved to approve as presented based on the fact the deck is not visible from the street therefore; it is not subject to review.

5 Conant Street

Neal Kimball said there is a change in roof pitch.

Moved - John Dowd moved to approve on the east elevation for cottages 1 and 2. The window change from 4 square to 6 light and the roof pitch change from 10 pitch to a 12 pitch.

Seconded by Nathan Butera. Voted unanimously by Clo Tepper, Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, John Dowd and Marcene Marcoux.

Polly Burnell moved to continue the meeting to noon on Thursday, February 9, 2006 for a site visit at 90 Commercial Street.

February 9, 2006 12:00 p.m.

90 Commercial Street

Present were Polly Burnell, Carol Neal, John Dowd and Clo Tepper.

The commission members reviewed the plans and compared them to the actual physical structure. They discussed the original railing design and window installation.

Moved – John Dowd moved the following:

- The clapboard on the storefront windows be removed and replaced with like material to match the adjacent windows
- To add 2 horizontal pieces of trim on the deck skirt.

Seconded by Carol Neal. Voted four in favor with no opposition.

Adjournment

Moved – Polly Burnell moved to adjourn the meeting at 12:51 p.m.

Seconded by Carol Neal. Voted unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,
Maxine Notaro, Permit Coordinator

Approved _____ at meeting of _____
John Dowd, Chairman