

**The Provincetown Historic District Commission  
Wednesday, April 26, 2006, Town Hall.**

**Meeting Minutes**

**Members present:** Carol Neal, Clo Tepper, Marcene Marcoux, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera.

**Members excused absent:** John Dowd - Chairperson

**Staff present:** Doug Taylor, Maxine Notaro.

Carol Neal called the meeting to order at 3:35 pm

**Administrative Reviews**

**437-439 Commercial Street** - Deborah Paine - discussion regarding Poor Richard's Landing, Street.

Deb Paine appeared to bring to the attention of the commission a situation regarding Chapter 91 licensing, which is in review. She highlighted the property as an historic artist enclave. She encouraged the board to consider having input on Chapter 91 licensing in order to preserve historic buildings and uses.

Polly Burnell advised Ms. Paine to meet with the Historical Commission at the upcoming May meeting.

**2006-30 (Applicant to submit revised plans as approved on 4/12/06)**

Application by Robert Hughes on behalf of O'Hara Family Trust to construct four new cottages at the property located at **204 Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA.**

**Members sitting on the case are:**

Nathan Butera, Clo Tepper, Polly Burnell and Marcene Marcoux. They reviewed the revised plans based on the previous decision.

**Discussion:** The applicant has incorporated the design changes noted.

**Motion:** Marcene Marcoux                      **Second:** Nathan Butera

To issue a certificate of appropriateness for the revised plans as presented.

**Yea:** Nathan Butera, Clo Tepper, Polly Burnell, and Marcene Marcoux

**Nay:** 0                      **Abstain:** 0

**2006-33 (Applicant to submit revised plans as approved on 4/12/06)**

Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Mitchell Hollander and Robert Purinton to demolish an existing structurally compromised, one-story, non-conforming dwelling and construct a new two-story dwelling with similar design and slightly larger footprint in a conforming location at the property located at **28 Alden Street, Provincetown, MA.**

**The case was referred back to staff for review.**

**229 Commercial Street** – Scott Ravelson – review revised plans as previously requested

**The applicant did not appear.**

**8 Montello St** – For relocation and renovation of a garage structure.

**Members sitting on the case are:** Clo Tepper, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell and Marcene Marcoux

Neal Kimball presented revised plans to the Board for review replacing the north and south elevations with new drawings. The intention is to keep the garage structure intact and make it the second floor of an art studio.

The Board explained to the applicant that typically they do not allow a one-story building going to a two-story structure. The current design is for the building to remain a subservient structure on the property. The applicant feels that a 1.5 story building is not adequate for the planned use as an artist studio.

**The case is continued to the next meeting.**

When the case comes back to the board it should be scheduled in the public hearing so the members have ample time to review the changes.

**56 Commercial St. – The Library –**

Debbie DeJonkers appeared before the Board and explained that they are trying to create a stairway from the front doors down to the street for the upcoming season. Barnstable County inmates and DPW will do the work. Pressure treated wood, cement bricks and metal railings will be used.

**Motion:** Nathan Butera           **Second:** Carol Neal

To issue a certificate of appropriateness for the plans, as presented, for the temporary staircase to the new library.

**Yea:** Carol Neal, Clo Tepper, Marcene Marcoux, Polly Burnell, and Nathan Butera.

**Nay:** 0           **Abstain:** 0

**383 Commercial ST – Bull Ring Wharf –** Laurie, of Peter’s Property Management presented the board with plans showing the east elevation of the building. The tenants wish to have 6 over 6 windows on the entire elevation. They would like to leave the existing sliders. There are 5 windows/sliders of a different size.

**Members sitting on the case are:** Marcene Marcoux, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell.

**Motion:** Nathan Butera           **Second:** Polly Burnell

To issue a certificate of appropriateness for the plans as presented with the following conditions:

The East elevation may have vinyl clad windows with exterior muntins.

The West elevation must have Anderson 400 series Wood right windows.

All replacement windows must conform to the windows policy and guidelines.

**Yea:** Marcene Marcoux, Nathan Butera, and Polly Burnell.

**Nay:** 0           **Abstain:** 0

***Public Hearing 4:00 p.m.***

**2006-28**

**Application by Fr. Henry Dahl, Pastor** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to raze the existing structure in order to reconfigure parking and traffic flow in conjunction with the proposed plan to relocate the existing rectory and rebuild the church in a new location. The existing garage will need to be razed as well to make room for the rectory relocation at the property located at **11 Prince Street and 3 Mozart Avenue, Provincetown, MA.**

**Members sitting on the case are:**

Clo Tepper, Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, Polly Burnell, Marcene Marcoux

**Discussion:** The pastor introduced Thomas Palanza, the design consultant for the project and presented plans and photos to the board. The diocese wishes to build the new church at a different location on the site in order to better meet state building and access codes. The applicant wishes to make changes to the rectory as part of the project. The rectory would be relocated and a new church would be built.

The applicant is seeking permission to demolish the rental building that currently exists on the site.

Polly Burnell read guideline for demolition.

**Public speaking in favor:**

Eva Cabral Edwards – explained that the plan puts the traffic/parking on the front of the church so that patrons are using the front entrance.

Marilyn Downey – on building committee for the church – safety issue spoke favorably to the issue of parking and

congestion as a safety issue on the site. This plan meets the town fire codes for ingress and egress.

**Public speaking against:**

Heidi Schultz, Prince Street. – Spoke to the green space which currently exists and that displacing a tenant of 17 years and paving the front area will drastically change the look and feel of the community.

Cindy Bose – the tenant of the church – does not wish to see it demolished.

Barbara Rushmore spoke against the demolition of the building. She is in favor of preserving the tree she described as one of the most beautiful trees in Provincetown. She encouraged a green space to preserve the tree.

Joan Gurreiro – a member of the parish – question why the house would be demolished. It was explained that it is to accommodate the new traffic flow. She spoke against displacing a year-round tenant in a sound building to create more parking since it “doesn’t make any sense.”

Donald Morris - Owns the parking lot next to the church and wants to see the church focus on the church and not add so much parking – as a competitor.

Carol Neal read a letter in the file objecting to the plans. They would like to see the church rebuilt in the old location.

**Discussion continued:**

Doug Taylor clarified for the gathering that the relocation of the building is not the issue being discussed. The issue is whether or not to demolish the building.

Carol Neal qualified the case by saying that this commission is charged with preserving the historic structures of this town.

The applicant explained that the wish is to rehab the rectory building and remove the rental building and then the church will no longer be a landlord. The church will not have rental units on the property.

Clo Tepper asked the applicant to clarify if they had considered how to keep the building in its present location or another location on the site. Was there any consideration given to keeping the building anywhere on this parcel of land?

James Quirk, diocese of Fall River spoke to the board about planning, zoning, and reconstruction issues. They need to be flexible and removing the building provides better flexibility.

Marcene Marcoux questioned how much effort has been put into saving/moving the building for preservation and use elsewhere in town. The church has not heard of any interest as of this date.

The number of parking spaces remains at 80. They are being relocated on the site.

The pastor explained that to keep the building on the property is moot since it would not be used. The tenant has found other housing and there is no plan to re-rent the building.

The board discussed “extraordinary” circumstances and whether the burning of the church applies to the need to demolish this building.

Except in extraordinary circumstances, to allow the demolition of a Historic building goes against the by-laws of the board

Clo Tepper would like more time to review the new information and perhaps make a site visit.

Members would like more time and information to consider the application.

The applicant will provide the following additional information to the board:

Artist's renderings of the new church,

An existing and proposed overlay on one site plan, and

Architectural changes made to the exterior building in question since it was built.

The applicant will return at the next meeting in 2 weeks. The material will be provided ahead of time so the members have time to review the information prior to the meeting.

**The case is continued to the next Public hearing.**

**2006-34**

**Application by Regina Binder on behalf of Alex Mazzocca and Glen Martin** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for approximately a 1300 square foot addition to a freestanding 2-story cottage at the property located at **15 Brewster Street, Provincetown, MA.**

**Members sitting on the case are:** Carol Neal, Clo Tepper, Marcene Marcoux, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera.

**Discussion:**

Glen Martin appeared before the board with a new application.

The garage was built between 1915 and 1920. The applicant is retaining the relationship of the garage to the house. The plan is to replace an existing one-story garage with a one-story residence. The plan is for a 1300 sq. ft. structure.

Maxine Notaro advised the board that the language in the application does not fully represent the proposal by the applicant.

For clarification the applicant is seeking to demolish the existing garage and build a new structure of a larger size in the same/similar location.

West elevation – door will be bead board, siding will be clapboard.

North elevation – plan is for a solid large single glass with wood frame door.

Roofing – asphalt

Siding – clapboard on front / cedar shingles

Height – 18' 4"

Windows – wood right series, exterior muntin,

The Board noted that it is a minimally visible location and the garage is not historically significant

**Public comment:** None in favor or against.

Carol Neal read one letter from the file from abutters raising concerns about the scale changes and another letter from an abutter in support of the project.

**Motion:** Nathan Butera            **Second:** Polly Burnell

Based on the consideration that the garage is not a historically significant structure and the site is minimally visible from a public way it is decided to issue a certificate of appropriateness for the plans dated 3/14/2006 with the following conditions/adjustments;

West elevation – door will be bead board, siding will be clapboard.

North elevation – plan is for a solid large single glass with wood frame door.

All windows will be Andersen Wood right series with exterior applied muntins.

All replacement windows must conform to the windows policy and guidelines.

**2006-35**

**Application by Beth Fidellow, Tim Sheehan and Erin Long** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to restore the front façade to its original look by removing the picture window and replacing with one entrance door and one existing window that matches the current installed windows at the property located at **7 Atlantic Avenue, Provincetown, MA.**

**The applicant did not appear. The case is continued to the next meeting.**

**2006-36 Application by Adolfo Perez Architect on behalf of Robert G. Dello Russo** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for the demolition of an existing structure and replace with a new dwelling of similar style, size and footprint at the property located at **3 Duncan Lane, Provincetown, MA.**

**Members sitting on the case are:**

Carol Neal, Clo Tepper, Marcene Marcoux, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera.

**Discussion:** The architect and property owner appeared to discuss demolition of the structure.

Carol Neal advised the applicant that demolition of the building is regulated by the guidelines. The architect advised the board that the building does not meet code.

Carol Neal clarified that the property is not in the historic district. The Board is only considering the demolition of the structure. The new construction is outside their purview.

The Board is doing research to determine the significance and/or condition of the structure. The issues to be reviewed include age of the building and historic use of the structure.

**Public comment:**

This was the only house on Duncan Lane that was owned by a carter and might have been a “teahouse” during prohibition.

Tom Boland – 7 Duncan lane – is concerned about the scale, the massing and the materials should be appropriate to Duncan Lane.

Rioss Cermoni - There is historic value to this type of Provincetown neighborhood.

Nathan Butera read the guideline regarding demolition delay

**The case is continued for administrative review at the next public meeting. In the interim, the board would like to see the plans for the proposed construction.**

**2006-37 Application by Lower Cape Communications, Inc.** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to replace deteriorated wooden doors with fiberglass doors at the property located at **494 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

**Members sitting on the case are:** Carol Neal, Clo Tepper, Marcene Marcoux, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera.

**Discussion:** Craig Poosilian and Jay Hazzington appeared before the board. The Schoolhouse Gallery is seeking to replace an existing door on the east side of the building.

**Public comment:** None in favor or opposed.

The east-facing door had a \$4K wooden door installed and the door has deteriorated. It is an ADA access. The applicant is requesting to use a fiberglass door.

Doug Taylor advised that it is not the front door and it is an ADA access so he is in support of a door that will last.

The board prefers the ½ glass, solid bottom. Fiberglass is OK but no faux grain. The door will have a smooth fiberglass finish. Style #FC62LE

**Motion:** Nathan Butera            **Second:** Carol Neal

To issue a certificate of appropriateness for the replacement of the door, with the following specifications;

Use style # FC62LE from the specification sheet submitted. This is a ½ glass design made of fiberglass. The door must have a smooth finish. No faux wood grain.

**Yea:** Carol Neal, Marcene Marcoux, Polly Burnell, and Nathan Butera.

**Nay:** Clo Tepper      **Abstain:** 0

***Administrative reviews, continued***

**28 Alden** – The Board reviewed the revised plans and found two changes are needed. They specified the changes on the plans for the building commissioner.

**Staff will issue decision/permit accordingly.**

**54 Bradford St.** – wishes install three new double hung windows 6 over 6 on the west elevation facing Bradford St.

**Referred back to staff.**

**491 Commercial St.** –

Doug Taylor requested the Board’s assistance in responding properly to the lawsuit in process. The Board provided the following wording for the response.

To clarify how the Board determined the doors were original... Members of the Board made site visit(s) and based on the exterior appearance of the door(s) the Board came to the conclusion they were original.

To clarify how the above (#3) was reached... Members examined historic photographs of the property, and the knowledge of the commission members as to construction and building materials of period structures within the Historic District.

***Minutes***

Approve minutes for the meeting of April 12, 2006

**Motion:** Polly Burnell      **Second:** Nathan Butera

**Vote:** 5-0-0

**Motion to adjourn:**      Clo Tepper      Second: Carol Neal

**Vote:** 5-0-0

Meeting adjourned at 7:00 pm

Respectfully submitted by

Carla Anderson

Recording Secretary

Approved by \_\_\_\_\_ at the meeting of \_\_\_\_\_.

John Dowd, Chairperson