

**The Provincetown Historic District Commission
Wednesday, May 10, 2006, Town Hall.**

Meeting Minutes

Members present: Carol Neal – Co-chairperson, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera, Marcene Marcoux.

Members excused absent: John Dowd – Chairperson, Clo Tepper.

Staff present: Maxine Notaro, Doug Taylor.

The meeting was called to order by Carol Neal at 3:50pm

Administrative Reviews

2006-36

Revised plans submitted by Adolfo Perez Architect on behalf of Robert G. Dello Russo for the demolition of an existing structure and replace with a new dwelling of similar style, size and foot print at the property located at **3 Duncan Lane, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case: Carol Neal, Marcene Marcoux, Polly Burnell and Nathan Butera.

Discussion: The applicants appeared with a full set of plans. The applicant is seeking to demolish a structure and erect a new building with a slightly larger footprint. The house is older than 1950.

Polly Burnell read one letter for the record from Robert Nelson who owned the building from 1977 to 2004. Polly Burnell does not wish to see this old and culturally significant structure demolished even though it is not in the Historic District.

Marcene Marcoux asked if there was any effort in planning to save any portion of the building. The architect explained that it is not economically feasible.

Nathan Butera stated that since the structure is not within the district and does not feel that the Board has the authority to delay the permit.

Carol Neal agreed that it does not fall under the guidelines of demolition delay.

Public comment: Hilda Neily would like to see the new construction retain the shape of the former, historic structure.

Motion: Nathan Butera **Second:** Carol Neal

In consideration of the fact that the building is not within the Historic District, the Board moved to grant a demolition permit.

Yea: Polly Burnell, Carol Neal, Nathan Butera and Marcene Marcoux

Nay: 0 **Abstain:** 0

Adam Wolf of 216 Bradford Street. Applicant seeks approval to remove a small section of cedar clapboard and replace with composition board.

Members sitting on the case are: Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, Polly Burnell, Marcene Marcoux

Discussion: Changing from cedar clapboard to composition board in a small area which is minimally visible.

The board would like the application scheduled for a full hearing.

Public Hearing 4:00 p.m.

Neal Kimball on behalf of Hilda Neily, 8 Montello St – Revised plans for the relocation and renovation of a garage structure.

Members sitting on the case are: Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell and Marcene Marcoux.

Discussion: The applicant and owner appeared with revised plans. The new plans reflect the use of building as an artist studio with large windows on the north side. Height above grade 19.3feet. Overall footprint 11.5 wide X 18' long.

The Board continued to discuss allowing the structure to become two full stories. Marcene Marcoux expressed that the revised plans seem to be incorporating some of the suggestions made by the Board.

Nathan Butera commented that it is a non-significant historic structure less than 50 years old, and is a working artist studio.

Hilda Neily commented that whatever she does to this building will still be dwarfed by the structure next door which has a 38' height.

The board discussed the possibility of adding a band at the height of the first story, but decided the current design is a more utilitarian, appropriate look and feel.

Public comment: None in favor or opposed.

Motion: Marcene Marcoux **Second:** Nathan Butera

Pursuant to all relevant guidelines, to grant a certificate of appropriateness for the plans dated 5/8/06 with the twin flat roof dormers.

All replacement windows must meet the approved window guidelines.

Yea: Marcene Marcoux, Nathan Butera and Polly Burnell

Nay: 0 **Abstain:** 0

2006-39 (Rescheduled to May 24, 2006)

Application by Paul F. Colburn on behalf of Dr. Charles Merrill for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a bedroom addition and replace the existing deck at the property located at **636 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Maxine informed the board that the case is rescheduled for 5/24/06.

2006-40

Application by Ann V. Welles for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to replace an existing deck substantially at grade and to remove the existing chimney and replace with a metal furnace flue at the property located at **12 Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, Polly Burnell and Marcene Marcoux.

Discussion: The applicant appeared to review the plans.

The deck is in need of being rebuilt for structural reasons and the applicant is seeking to make it slightly larger. Existing is 155 square feet and the plan is for 199 square feet.

Doug Taylor commented that this is a patio and not a deck. According to building code he considers this a landscape item. This element does not require action by the Board.

The chimney – is visible from a public way and is the venting for the furnace. The brick chimney continues to fail. The rubber roofing, chimney cap and flashing have all been replaced in an effort to close a leak. The applicant is seeking to remove the chimney and replace with a modern metal-bestos sleeve.

Polly Burnell read the Guideline 8.b – and commented that she did not consider it a significant chimney or an original chimney.

Public comment: None in favor or opposed.

Motion: Polly Burnell **Second:** Carol Neal

Pursuant to Guideline 8.b, to grant a certificate of appropriateness for the removal of the existing non-historic chimney and replace it with the requested venting pipe.

Yea: Carol Neal, Marcene Marcoux, Polly Burnell and Nathan Butera.

Nay: 0 **Abstain:** 0

2006-41

Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Carriage House Realty Trust, Ken Hassett Trustee for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to remove and reconstruct and roof deck at the front right section of the building for roof repairs. Remove the north-facing casement window at the roof deck and replace with an egress door. Add a small doghouse dormer for installation of a door. Add egress stairs from the roof deck to grade along the north-facing side of the court yard, match existing; repair/replace trim and first floor windows in kind as needed within the roof deck work area at the property located at **7 Central Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, Polly Burnell and Marcene Marcoux.

Discussion: Neal Kimball presented plans to the Board.

The door, deck, and stairs are to accommodate an additional required means of egress for the second floor. An additional mirroring set of stairs will be constructed. The roof deck is being replaced in kind. The railings will be done to match the left portion of the building.

The large windows will be replaced in kind, but there is some damage from leaking so the roof deck must be removed so the roof leak can be repaired properly.

The gable peak is to help add another 2' within the building.

Marcene Marcoux requested additional dimensions and elevation information be included on future plans. Carol Neal added that she would like to see drawings that show the size of the building in relationship to the surrounding buildings.

The Board agreed the building has been significantly altered over the years.

The proposed modifications are within the guidelines and are in keeping with the current design.

Public comment: None in favor or opposed.

Motion: Carol Neal **Second:** Nathan Butera

Pursuant to Guidelines 6.b for doors, 13 for stairs, 8.a for dormers, to grant a certificate of appropriateness for the plans dated 4/4/06.

All replacement windows must meet the approved window guidelines and policies.

Yea: Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, Polly Burnell and Marcene Marcoux.

Nay: 0 **Abstain:** 0

2006-42

Application by Keith Glover and Lenore Hill for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to repair or replace existing windows and doors and to add additional windows and doors. Add six (6) skylights, convert the existing catwalk to a deck, repair and extend the first floor deck and add a chimney at the property located at **23 Brewster Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: Carol Neal, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera and Marcene Marcoux

Discussion: The applicants appeared to review the proposed plans for the structure which was originally constructed in the 1960s as a studio space. Over the years several expansions for living and more studio space has been added over the years. It is a two family, two kitchens and 2.5 baths. The north elevation will not change.

Front elevation – west

Skylights – venting skylights, needs to be low profile. The one on the kitchen area will be the most visible of all the skylights.

Back elevation – south

Elevation will increase to allow for full floor height in the dormer area.

Carol Neal stated the changes are in keeping with the design of the building. Polly Burnell agreed that these changes are in keeping with the historic character of the building. Marcene Marcoux agreed that the changes will add to the integrity of the building. Nathan Butera had questions regarding the windows and doors.

The specifications call for Norco windows and doors – Wooden, double insulated.

Chimney – remove existing and install metal-bestos vent pipe.

Alternate railing details will be wood instead of hardware cloth panels.

The Board needs corrected drawing of the railings provide to staff.

The structure will remain a two family with two kitchens.

The catwalk is expanding to become a deck area. Carol Neal commented that the location of the building and the visibility does not make this a factor. Polly Burnell said it is appropriate to an artist space and Marcene Marcoux agrees it is very 1960s.

Public comment: None in favor or against.

Motion: Carol Neal **Second:** Marcene Marcoux

Pursuant to Guidelines 6.b for doors, 9.a and 9.c for decks and railing, 5.a and 5.c for windows, 8.c for skylights, to grant a certificate of appropriateness for the plans as presented with these changes:

Railing system will be wooden 1x1 slats, replace page 11, and provide new drawings to staff.

Chimney will be removed, and vent pipe installed. Replace page 6 of the plans with new drawings to staff.

All replacement windows must meet the window guidelines and policies.

Skylights must be low profile.

Yea: Carol Neal, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera and Marcene Marcoux

Nay: 0 **Abstain:** 0

2006-43

Application by Robert Valois on behalf of Robert Nee and Charles Collins for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to enclose the area under the existing second floor deck and replace doors and windows at the property located at **345A Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, Polly Burnell, Marcene Marcoux

Discussion: Robert Valois appeared to review the application with the Board. The changes are most visible from the beach, not another public way.

South elevation – proposes a folding door panel system with a horizontal center rail similar to an existing screen door.

Visibility is minimal in the locations where the casement windows are to be replaced on the west elevation. The casements will be retained on the visible east elevation.

Public comment: None in favor or opposed.

Motion: Marcene Marcoux **Second:** Polly Burnell

Pursuant to Guidelines 5.a and 5.c for windows, 6.b for doors, 15 for alteration of deck enclosure, to grant a certificate of appropriateness for the plans dated 4/5/06 as presented.

All replacement windows must meet the window guidelines and policies.

2006-36

Application by Beth Fidellow, Tim Sheehan and Erin Long for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to restore the front façade to its original look by removing the picture window and replacing with one entrance door and one existing window that matches the current installed windows at the property located at **7 Atlantic Avenue, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case: Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, Polly Burnell, Marcene Marcoux

Discussion: Maxine presented the application.

The applicant is seeking to replace a window in like kind with a 4 over 1 by removing a rear elevation window and placing it on the front façade. The rear elevation would receive a 2 over 1 to match the bottom floor of the rear elevation.

The applicant is seeking to replace a door and wants a 6 light over 3 panel door.

The bBoard discussed with staff the type of door designs that would be appropriate to the structure.

The applicant needs to bring additional door designs to the board for administrative review.

Public comment: None in favor or opposed.

Motion: Nathan Butera **Second:** Carol Neal

Pursuant to Guideline 5 for windows, to grant a certificate of appropriateness for the plans for the window replacement. All replacement windows must meet the window guidelines and policies.

The applicant will return for administrative review and approval of an appropriate door design.

Yea: Nathan Butera, Carol Neal, Polly Burnell, Marcene Marcoux

Nay: 0 **Abstain:** 0

Approve Minutes

Motion: Marcene Marcoux **Second:** Polly Burnell

To approve the minutes of 4/26/06 with corrections to be submitted by Polly Burnell.

Vote: 4-0-0

Other business

Carol Neal wants to have a business meeting to discuss the guidelines changes which resulted from the vote at the Town Meeting warrant. Staff will provide copies to the Board.

Marcene Marcoux wants to discuss consistency of the basic dimensional information provided on each application.

149 Commercial Street, Sandbar “Village, Burger Mary’s”

Referred to staff to be resolved.

HDC goals and objectives for the town-wide plan –

Referred to the chairperson, John Dowd, to be completed.

491 Commercial St. – lawsuit update. The litigation will be dismissed. The door has been repaired and will be reinstalled. The building commissioner and a board member will inspect the door prior to installation.

Old movie theatre-DeRyder - Nathan Butera asked about newly installed windows which were not approved by the Board. The building commissioner will discuss the issue with the property owner and the contractor.

Motion to adjourn: Carol Neal **Second:** Nathan Butera

Meeting adjourned at 6pm.

Respectfully submitted

Carla Anderson,
Recording Secretary

Approved by _____ at the meeting of _____.
John Dowd, Chairperson