

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Public Meeting

August 9, 2006

Judge Welsh Hearing Room

3:30 p.m.

Members Present: Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera, John Dowd, Marcene Marcoux, Carol Neal, and E. Clothier Tepper.

Members Absent: None

Staff: Doug Taylor and Maxine Notaro.

291 Commercial Street

Approved a full view slider with replacement windows 2/1 vinyl. Deb Paine presented a vinyl paradigm window with exterior applied muntins.

27 Pleasant Street - Richard Salvador

Notice out for September 13th meeting

291 Commercial Street - Joy Cummings

Construct dormer on east side for egress.

Motion: Accept as presented.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Carol Neal Vote: 6-0-0 unanimous

5 Conant Street - Neal Kimball

Cottage #1 - west elevation - door moves slightly to right. West elevation windows are slightly narrower. South - remove window grills. John said the changes are minimal and minor and way up on the hill. Not adding or detracting in any manner. Neal said he would like to demolish the cottages and reconstruct per plans dated August 9, 2006.

Motion: Accept the plans dated August 9, 2006

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Polly Burnell Vote: unanimous.

2006-58

Submitted photo of late 1800s/early 1900s showing 1 1/2 story structure. Neal submitted revised plans. Height is 24'8" as opposed to 29'4". Neal said 2 full floors before roof structure sat on ceiling frame. They reduced roof by 5' leaving 3' knee wall on 2nd floor. Height of foundation from grade will not change.

Clo said the first design was attractive but this one is even better and is pleased to see him accommodate his neighbors.

Motion: Accept as presented.

Motion: Clo Tepper Seconded: Marcene Marcoux Vote: unanimous

207A Bradford Street

Letter from Doug Taylor saying it can proceed forward or be tabled until other boards deal with it.

Motion: Table the issue until Town Counsel determines whether it's a buildable lot.

Motion: Carol Neal Seconded: Polly Burnell Vote: unanimous.

At this point Julie Schecter asked, "How do I move this issue to the next step?"

Carol said that we've asked the Town Manager for a ruling from the Town Counsel.

Julie asked could the Commission look at the design of the building and give a decision until the case is resolved?

Marcene wants the issue resolved, First, a key issue is the height of the original dune in contrast to changes made to the dune and what its' present height now is.

Nathan said - we could approve a design because it's good for 1 year.

531 Commercial Street

Tami Acuri, lawyer, presented the case representing Rick & Cheryl Bready. Glen Parker will be the supervisor of the project once it is underway. Tami - regarding architecture - quoted Mary Heaton Vorse - "Provincetown is like an onion - layers upon layers." It represents New Englanders, Portuguese, and summer folk.

Her clients are homeowners and summer residents in Provincetown. Ms. Bready has been coming to Town with her family for many years. She is concerned and committed to her house and its architectural structure. She and her husband have renovated homes in other historic district. They are committed to visual and aesthetic beauty that emphasizes three things:

1. Clients didn't purchase the property to make it a McMansion. There will be no increase in mass. They are converting back to a single family home, making it more aesthetically pleasing, uniform and with better quality of workmanship in the neighborhood. They are not adding rooms or making it higher than what is there.
2. She personally thinks it will be an asset due to the degree of quality materials. Section 8-1 using highest and best quality of materials on the market. Aesthetically and architecturally pleasing to the neighborhood. Tami presented a book to review photos. South elevation is more architecturally pleasing.
3. Elements of concern: Tami said they would want a secondary door on the west side of the property. Kathy Bishop, the former owner, did state there was originally a door on the west side of the property.

North Elevation - John Dowd said the windows are colonial style window. These have smaller panes the earlier they are. This is a Victorian building we are dealing with here.

Clo cited guidelines #2 - specific windows. He felt that under design elements, we have to focus on the building that exists.

Tami said, "Would you not say that it is significantly altered?"

John - no significantly altered - 19th Century renovation is still historical

Tami – The historic survey said it was built in 1900s and the survey lists it as a Queen Anne. The survey should be a part of a determination. Original was colonial style house significantly altered to Victorian.

Clo - What is there presently as it exists is a historically significant structure.

John Dowd - Both designs have historical significance to turn Colonial/Victorian. Could retain Victorian summer cottage look to trace to later Colonial Revival adds a 3rd layer.

Tami said that 418 Commercial was a single family in 1902.

John said it was built as a Christian Science Church. Tami replied that the maps say it did not become a church until 1929. In 1912 the structure became a 2-story structure, and she asked John: "Are you are going strictly by the footprint?" Clo said that the Packard Gallery as it is now is a different structure from that of 531 Commercial Street. There are no similarities in the buildings. Tami replied that similarities exist in the years built and in the area. In 1910 it was a colonial revival building with 6 over 9 windows. It's similar to her client's building. - 103 Commercial Street has 6 over 9 windows.

John replied that 103 Commercial Street was built about 10 years ago. Tami said 6/9 and 9/6 is in good use in Provincetown. 597 Commercial Street put on her survey because it was a stylistic similar to 531 Commercial Street. The Packard Gallery is of that stature. John countered by saying that the Packard Gallery has a very formal high-style building. Tami said 449 Commercial has 6/6 in front and 9/6 on sides. The 6/9s make the overall style of a uniform shape and have more of a cottage feel. John said this style window is not appropriate to the age of the building. Tami said that 597 Commercial was built in 1930.

John said - your client's building was built in a different period. What's wrong with 6/6? Tami said that 1900s have 9/6 and 6/6. The Mayo house was built in 1980. John Dowd said that Ms. Guadazno said the windows in the Mayo house were replacements. Tami countered by saying that Ms. Guadazno told her the windows were the original style. Carol Neal said that the house under discussion is 531 Commercial. Replacement windows in bylaw 5A as stated. Tami said the application involves the appropriate style for the building.

Marcene said the 6/9 and 9/6 reflect a style in Town. She does know the building and it has been significantly altered. She's not against 6/9. It's an attempt to use a window used in Provincetown and she understands the general flow of the argument - Sees it as part of guideline that can be interpreted in this way since it seems ambiguous. Glen said the house shown on 449 Commercial Street - Is it remarkably consistent with 531 Commercial? Clo and Carol said they should be looking at the specific house in question. Tami said her client wants a beautiful, uniform, architectural house. John said 449 Commercial Streets has 6/6 and 9/6 on sides. 6/6 on the front are old and were there as original to the building. "Why is 6/6 not good enough for the homeowner? It is in the building in other facades. Is 6/6 possible?"

John then said that his first choice is 2/2 gains historical significance. 6/6 could have been in the house originally and Victorianized when the tower was added. Glen said "Don't know what style it originally was but a similar building is the 449 Commercial Street building and he suggests that his client accept this as a compromise.

Tami said the original condition is in altered state. Marcene said a compromise position as John says is 6/6 and that would be fitting. Carol said her position is replacement windows. 2/3 windows have gained significance.

North Elevation - corner boards deleted and shingle pattern consistent with the house.

East Elevation - no bay window - bump out window agreed upon - windows to be A's and O's.

South Elevation - waterfront elevations more flexible - guideline as presented.

West - eliminate under hang

Tami - The door 8.1 - She has been told that the Commissioners shall consider similar features in a structure in the surrounding buildings as a whole. John - the comparisons are central doorways in formal buildings and garage buildings. 473 Commercial St (MacMillan House) is similar to 531 Commercial. 473 Commercial Street was built in 1874. Claire Baisley, the author, would say we don't know what was there unless we had pictures. Cannot correct history - why reflect history?

Clo said this building cannot have exactly what your client wants. John said - our focus is to preserve, not design. If you try to build in Nantucket, South End, you have to keep what you have. We will compromise. Clo said that John was offering suggestions, and there may be design suggestions. But on the west, - the 6 doors, it would be good if the balcony is removed and refer doorway at 422 Commercial Street.

John said, "I'd go with 422 Commercial doors - I can live with these choices but they go against the grain. To make the doorway consistent with the house, I'd put in such doors. Single door with hood and geared down with sidelights. Polly said she could reluctantly agree with that. Tami said #2 choice would be drawing West elevation. Polly said - I couldn't approve the doors just on sketches.

Glen said - leave the small door as is and the second layer door without balcony.

Tami - said a concession on the doors - is there a concession on the windows? Clo said a majority of the board speaks to 2/2 windows and doorway of that on 422 Commercial Street.

Tami said - I have one more question - If she were to make the suggested changes and buy a cleaner set of plans - doorways on West similar to Commercial St address and 2 double hungs - and adjusted on bay window double hung 6/6 - would the board agree? If windows shift from 9/6 to 6/6 - What would the board do?

Clo - I'd be happy to see elevations. I won't argue with 6/6.

John - I'm in favor of 6/6

Carol - I'm against 6/6

Polly - I'm against 6/6

Marcene - I'm in favor of 6/6.

Tami requested a continuation meeting to the August 23rd meeting.

Motion: Continue the case to the August 23rd, 2006 meeting.

Motion: Marcene Marcoux Seconded: Carol Neal Vote: unanimous.

Meeting was adjourned at this point.

Approved by _____ on _____, 2006.

John Dowd, Chair