



# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

October 20, 2010

Grace Gouveia Building- Room 10

3:30 p.m.

**Members Present:** Polly Burnell (arr 4:00 p), Lynne Corbett, Marcene Marcoux (arr 3:40p) David McGlothlin, and Carol Neal.

**Members Absent:** Nathan Butera (resigned) and John Dowd (traveling)

**Staff:** Russell Braun and Maxine Notaro

## Work Session 3:30 p.m.

### ●Public Statements

There were none.

### Administrative Reviews

**124 Commercial Street** – The new owner now wants to remove the chimney since it's ready to fall onto Whorf's Court and is a public safety hazard. This was approved with the stipulation that it has to be rebuilt using "new old brick."

**17 Conant Street** – The owner wants to replace the lattice with balusters. Approved by the HDC but it must have captured balusters and not as shown in the plan presented.

**74 Commercial Street** – More of the design work was presented and now they want to remove two windows (Octagon House). No problem but the HDC just wished that the ENTIRE plan had been presented initially.

**356 Commercial Street** – They were supposed to bring back revised plans. Maxine wrote up the decision and thus the case is now closed.

**122 Bradford Street – Sunset Inn** – The same door is coming back to the HDC for the umpteenth time. (pictures of door, etc.) The owners have been working on this project for about one year looking at all the different options. The fellow who presented said that he was the 4<sup>th</sup> contractor (he had restored 4 Atwood Ave and their door was salvageable). He also restored a door at 101 Bradford Street; thus he knows doors. He gave a lot of detail about his searching and assessing the

door and felt that there was just too much rot to deal with. Most Victorian doors were custom made and cannot be repaired since they are one of a kind. He proposed replacing it with a custom door and he will leave all the existing exterior trims, etc. He continued by saying that he does a lot of work on older homes and he's looked at different doors and he's even been on Craig's list.

David M said, "So you're going to replicate the door and in the past this was not proposed. Replication is all we ever asked for."

The HDC now only would like to see samples and/or pictures of the glass that will be installed in the door. The contractor will return to another meeting with that.

### **29 Alden Street – Unit 7**

Moe Van Derek said that he owns the shed across the street and wants to know if the doors and windows are acceptable. Moe said that because it was an old shed, windows were put in helter skelter. He had no specifics, just a lot of drawings that detailed very little.

Marcene M. felt that it really should have a full hearing. She also said that she's in sync with what Moe is doing but the HDC needs the whole package, a.k.a. a plan. Carol N. said that she wants pictures of what it looked like before. Moe said that it was essentially a non building that was built in 1888 and had become a guitar repair shop, etc.

Moe will return with a plan and present for a full hearing.

### **Library Landscape Design**

Marcene said that on Tuesday, October 26<sup>th</sup> at 5:00 p.m. there will be a meeting held in the Mark Jacobs meeting room on the 1<sup>st</sup> floor of the library to discuss the library's landscape design and also the lower level. Anyone from HDC who can attend is invited but if more than 3 of the committee members intend going, the meeting must be posted.

#### **● Review and approve previous minutes**

The approved minutes will be discussed later on in this meeting.

#### **● Any other business that shall properly come before the board**

There was none.

**Public Hearing 4:05 p.m.**

**FY11-11 (Postponed from October 6, 2010)**

Application by Steven Cook of Cotuit Bay Design, LLC on behalf of Michael MacIntyre for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a new 2800 square foot two-story Gambrel Style wood framed house at the property located at **20A Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Carol Neal stepped down from hearing this case.

Steven Cook, the designer, presented the plan and David Nicolau, the broker, was there to oversee the hearing. David's first question was, "How many votes are needed for approval?" Maxine said that you need 3 out of 4 in favor.

The first plan developed was scrapped because they decided they didn't want to cut into the hill. The new plan was entirely different and showed a 2,800 sq ft, two-story Gambrel Style, wood framed house.

Mr. Cook said that it's a difficult site and what we've come up with is a traditional design and we set the front door under a deck on the side. It is a traditional gambrel design and there is a roof deck that you won't be able to see from the street.

Mr. Nicolau said that the height is just below the lawn of the Lands End Inn so it certainly won't interfere with the Inn's views. After the plan was presented the meeting was opened up to the public.

Deb Paine rose to speak for two of her clients who own at 18 and 21 Commercial Street. These owners are out of the country and these are some of their considerations. The height of the proposed gambrel is 26 ft and these two buildings (18 & 21) will be buried by this house. 18 Commercial Street which is on a very low lot does have concerns about what she'll be looking up at and it will loom above her. Also, the south elevation on the plan is inaccurate because it doesn't show the garage which has been proposed. Deb also wanted the owner to get a rendering of what the south elevation will look like. There are no specs on the windows and she noticed there is a gas fireplace on the inside. Question: will there be a chimney? Deb finally requested that the HDC be careful about the details and/or specs.

Next Bill Dougal, a local real estate broker, spoke on behalf of David Jarrett, 20 Commercial Street – a direct abutter. Mr. Jarrett has a utility easement and his questions are, “Where will the house be built and how will it affect his easement?”

Polly Burnell wondered about the cut sheets and said that it’s a nice enough design but she is concerned about the height.

Steven Cook said, “It’s only a story and a half house!”

Marcene said that she really had a sense of it fitting into the hillside but now she would like a computerized rendering since she doesn’t have enough sense of the real height of it. She also said she would find it helpful if she had the rendering and how high the retaining wall will be? The answer of 6 or 7 ft – is not definite.

David agreed with Marcene about getting a 3D and, too, there’s a lot of detail missing. Mr. Cook said that there will be Anderson windows and David said that you are going to have to come back. There needs to be more specifics to it and we need to see it on the plan.

**Motion: Move to continue the case to the near future.**

**Motion: Marcene Marcoux                      Seconded: Carol Neal                      Vote: 4-0-0**

#### FY11-12

Application by Jennifer Cabral and Ian Leahy for a certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicants seek approval to raise the peak of the roof above the kitchen, add shed dormers on the north and south elevations and add doors, windows, and a skylight at the property located at **160 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA**

Jennifer presented the proposed plan to the HDC. She said that instead of the north and south elevations – the plan refers to the east and west elevations. The east elevation faces central street and the plan is proposed to fix leaky roof problems. The other problems referred to no master bathroom and very poor closet space. Also mentioned was that the house costs a lot to heat and they propose living in the rear of the house during most of the winter in order to conserve fuel costs. The peak above the kitchen will rise about 23 inches. They also anticipate using Bonneville windows which are all wood and this company caters to historic windows.

A back yard abutter, Wendy Everett said she supported the plan but when people do these things it's hard to visualize the finished product. She is concerned about the whole integrity of the design.

Bob Sanborn owns many properties and he supports the application. Maxine will check her e-mails because 3 Atlantic Ave and another abutter from that area also sent in letters of support.

Carol liked the original simplicity of that building which was built around 1840 – and now we've got additional lines that complicate this building. Polly & Lynne agreed. Jennifer, the owner, also agreed with them but it's a north faced wall and is not visible from the street. Jennifer also said the existing spaces are not functional.

David felt that what people see from Commercial Street is what is important to HDC. These changes are not prominent so he's O.K. with it.

**Motion: Move to accept the plan as proposed.**

**Motion: Carol Neal                      Seconded: Polly Burnell                      Vote: 5-0-0.**

FY11-13 (Withdrawn at applicants request prior to abutter notification)

Application by Mark Kennane of Cape Associates, Inc. on behalf of Gregg Russo for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a new single family dwelling at the property located at **4 Winthrop Street, Provincetown, MA**

**Motion: Move to allow the applicant to withdraw without prejudice and without time constraints.**

**Motion: David McGlothlin      Seconded: Marcene Marcoux                      Vote: 5-0-0**

### **Comments from Deb Paine**

She said, regarding 20A Commercial Street – that what will make or break that gambrel is the trim that is used. It's not necessarily flat trim and it would be important for the look of it. The HDC has no concept of how large a 2800 sq ft. house can be and she feels you really need a scale calculation. Also it was mentioned that Jennifer Cabral's house (a very large house) has about 3200 sq ft so that gives you an indication of the size of 2800. Deb continued by saying that you might want to consider that and you really need a building scale on an application.

**Motion: Move to amend the application to include building scale and more detail in plans.** This motion did not have a second and will be taken under advisement.

Russell Braun said you need to be more specific in computer modeling and its not that hard to do any more. Even if they're sketches – just as a visualization tool. It should be demanded on a more consistent basis.

**Fence at Bradford & Conwell**

Justin Post sent a violation notice to the owners of the Bradford & Conwell Street corner property (across from FarLand). They have installed a higher fence (up from 2 ft to 4 ft) and there is now a visibility issue at that corner. The owners have been given until November 3<sup>rd</sup> to rectify the problem.

**•Review and approve previous minutes**

<b>May 24, 2010 meeting</b>	<b>approved as written</b>	<b>Vote: 5-0-0.</b>
<b>June 16, 2010 meeting</b>	<b>approved as amended</b>	<b>Vote: 5-0-0.</b>
<b>July 21, 2010 meeting</b>	<b>approved as amended</b>	<b>Vote: 5-0-0.</b>
<b>August 4, 2010 meeting</b>	<b>approved as written</b>	<b>Vote: 5-0-0.</b>
<b>September 1, 2010 meeting</b>	<b>approved as amended</b>	<b>Vote: 5-0-0.</b>
<b>September 9, 2010 Executive</b>	<b>approved as amended</b>	<b>Vote: 5-0-0.</b>
<b>September 15, 2010 meeting</b>	<b>approved as written</b>	<b>Vote: 5-0-0.</b>

**The above seven minutes were moved, seconded, and approved by all.**

**Adjournment happened at 5:30 p.m.**

Respectfully submitted,

*Evelyn Gaudiano*

E. Rogers Gaudiano

**Approved by** \_\_\_\_\_ **on** \_\_\_\_\_, 2010.  
John Dowd, Chairman